

# Critical Discourse Analysis of Ethnic and Religious Minority Representation in Newspapers in Pakistan

**Farhana Shahzad**

Lecturer, Lahore University Management Sciences

## **Abstract**

Newspapers have a global readership and are responsible for the dissemination of information. Like most texts, they are written from human perspectives, and can perpetuate hegemonic constructions of otherisation. In each context, the conceptual binaries of ‘us’ versus ‘them’ varies and is propagated by newspaper media. Analysing the contents of newspapers for the representation of minorities is essential during the present times when intercultural and interethnic discourse is ubiquitous. Newspapers can play an instrumental role in curtailing imbalanced social constructions between majorities and minorities in society.

The literature reviewed revealed no study undertaken to detect the representation of minorities of Pakistan in the newspaper media. To fill this gap, a critical discourse analysis and a quantitative content analysis of English newspapers in Pakistan was conducted to detect misrepresentation and marginalisation of minorities in the Pakistani context. The present study derived an eclectic critical framework of detectors from the literature reviewed on critical discourse analysis and stereotypical otherisation perpetuated through the newspaper’s media. The choice of critical detection framework was tailor made to fulfill the societal imbalances witnessed in the Pakistani context. Content analysis methods were applied to first investigate frequency of occurrences of elements of the framework within the newspaper corpus, and then critical discourse methods were used to qualitatively investigate these elements further.

The findings highlighted misrepresentation and the perpetuation of stereotypical constructions of minorities in the newspapers. Minorities were perceived as problematic, not occupying positions of power, and as out-groups (otherisation). The employment of rhetorical devices; metonymy, nominalisation and passivisation were detected especially in the phrasing of headlines or sentences where majority perpetrators were involved. An analysis of images revealed that minorities were shown as targets of violence and at the received end of protests.

Recommendations for the publication policies of English newspapers are made to conduct and incorporate writing workshops for journalists to integrate a more informed approach while penning newspaper content. Pedagogical implications, particularly for tertiary teachers of media disciplines, are discussed to instil critical thinking and writing skills to manifest egalitarian writing stances. Future research implications are also outlined.

**Keywords:** Critical Discourse Analysis, Minorities Representation, Marginalisation, Otherisation, Nominalisation, Passivisation.

## 1. Introduction

This chapter consists of five sections. It will commence with the description of religious and ethnic minorities within the population of Pakistan. Secondly, the rationale for the present study will be explained. The aim of the study will then be elaborated followed by the research questions. The chapter ends with an overview of the dissertation.

### 1.1 Religious and ethnic minorities of Pakistan:

Pakistan is a culturally diverse country. Although most of the population is predominantly Muslim, various ethnicities belonging to different religious origins cohabit the country. Even before the creation of Pakistan, minorities; Hindus, Sikhs, Christians, Ahmadis, Parsis, and Jews have inhabited the sub continental region for centuries. After the formation of Pakistan in 1947, Hindus that did not migrate became a minority along with the rest of the groups. According to a recent survey conducted in 2018 by the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, the province wise percentages of minorities is elaborated in Table A.

**Table A: Percentages of each religious minority population of Pakistan**

| Administrative Unit |       | POPULATION BY RELIGION |           |              |                  |                  |        |
|---------------------|-------|------------------------|-----------|--------------|------------------|------------------|--------|
|                     |       | Muslim                 | Christian | Hindu (Jati) | Qadiani (Ahmadi) | Scheduled Castes | Others |
| Pakistan            |       | 96.28                  | 1.59      | 1.60         | 0.22             | 0.25             | 0.07   |
|                     | Rural | 96.49                  | 1.10      | 1.80         | 0.18             | 0.34             | 0.08   |
|                     | Urban | 95.84                  | 2.59      | 1.16         | 0.29             | 0.06             | 0.06   |
| Khyber Pakhtunkhwa  |       | 99.44                  | 0.21      | 0.03         | 0.24             | *                | 0.08   |
|                     | Rural | 99.65                  | 0.03      | *            | 0.22             | *                | 0.08   |
|                     | Urban | 98.42                  | 1.06      | 0.11         | 0.31             | 0.01             | 0.09   |
| F A T A             |       | 99.6                   | 0.07      | 0.03         | 0.21             | 0.03             | 0.07   |
|                     | Rural | 99.63                  | 0.04      | 0.03         | 0.21             | 0.03             | 0.06   |
|                     | Urban | 98.16                  | 1.17      | 0.32         | 0.10             | .007             | 0.23   |
| Punjab              |       | 97.21                  | 2.31      | 0.13         | 0.25             | 0.03             | 0.07   |
|                     | Rural | 97.66                  | 1.87      | 0.15         | 0.19             | 0.05             | 0.08   |
|                     | Urban | 96.25                  | 3.27      | 0.06         | 0.37             | 0.02             | 0.03   |
| Sindh               |       | 91.31                  | 0.97      | 6.51         | 0.14             | 0.99             | 0.08   |
|                     | Rural | 88.12                  | 0.14      | 9.77         | 0.12             | 1.79             | 0.06   |
|                     | Urban | 94.67                  | 1.84      | 3.08         | 0.17             | 0.14             | 0.10   |
| Balochistan         |       | 98.75                  | 0.40      | 0.49         | 0.15             | 0.10             | 0.10   |
|                     | Rural | 99.42                  | 0.06      | 0.15         | 0.14             | 0.12             | 0.10   |
|                     | Urban | 96.61                  | 1.49      | 1.58         | 0.16             | 0.05             | 0.10   |
| Islamabad           |       | 95.53                  | 4.07      | 0.02         | 0.34             | *                | 0.03   |
|                     | Rural | 98.80                  | 0.94      | *            | 0.23             | *                | 0.03   |
|                     | Urban | 93.83                  | 5.70      | 0.03         | 0.40             | *                | 0.03   |

\* Refers to a very small proportion.

Table A illustrates that Pakistan comprises of 96.28% of Muslims, 1.59% Christians, 1.60% Hindus, 0.22% Qadianis, 0.25% Scheduled castes, 0.07% of others. ‘These religious minorities inhabit all the provinces along with the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) region also known as the Tribal areas. These areas are not under the provincial governments that are governed by Ministry of States and Frontier Regions in Islamabad ("FATA - Official Web Portal," n.d.). Since Hindus, Sikhs, Christians and Qadianis are dispersed across the entire country and reside amongst the Muslim majorities, they are subjected to marginalisation. News of incidents associated with minority populations are sporadically covered by the mainstream newspaper media.

### 1.2 Rationale of the study

During the last couple of years, Pakistani media’s focus on minorities has amplified. Some recent high-profile events sparked media interest with the acquittal of Asia Bibi (Christian peasant woman) from the blasphemy case, the removal of Atif Mian (Ahmedi/Quadiani sect) from the Economic Advisory Council and forced Hindu conversions. All these incidents, alongside several others, have been the focus of the

newspapers in the last couple of years. Despite a growing media presence, research into ethnic and religious minority representation in the newspaper media, and its repercussions is a path that is relatively less trodden by the researchers in the region.

In the last decade, the field of critical discourse analysis (CDA) has become the focus of researchers in the state and studies in this realm have gained popularity. Although a few studies have been conducted which incorporate CDA as their primary research methodology for analyzing issues, none of them have used a mixed method analysis for detecting ethnic and religious minorities' representation in Pakistani newspapers. To fill in this gap, and to triangulate the findings, the research method selected to study the representation of religious and ethnic minorities is a qualitative critical discourse analysis and a quantitative content analysis of a corpus of the newspaper articles, editorials, opinion pieces, newspaper magazines, and general news.

### 1.3 Aim of the Study:

The present study is undertaken to detect the misrepresentation of religious and ethnic minorities of Pakistan in the Newspaper contents of three major Daily newspapers of Pakistan: *Dawn*, *Pakistan Today* and *The Nation*. The contents selected for detailed scrutiny include newspaper headlines, hard news, opinion pieces, columns, editorials, magazine articles, and photographs published in the newspapers pertaining to the ethnic and religious minorities of Pakistan.

### 1.4 Research Questions:

CDA is an interdisciplinary research approach which focuses on the analysis of discourse to detect any social imbalance of power by the hegemony of certain elite social actors involved in a discourse created through misrepresentation, stereotyping in preconceived roles dictated through traditions or numbers in terms of majorities versus the minorities (Fairclough, 2001; Van Dijk, 1998). This study will question the social imbalance through stereotyped roles, images and *otherisation* by asking the following questions:

1. Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major Newspapers?
2. Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as 'out-groups' in the newspaper content?
3. How are the images/photographs in Newspapers positioning ethnic minorities in moments of protests or violence?
4. Are the violent images against ethnic minorities inducing violent acts against them?
5. Are the actions taken against the minorities represented by nominalisation and passivisation and through metonymy in the newspaper headlines?
6. What type of language i.e. positive/negative used to discuss ethnic religious minorities in Pakistan?
7. Are the minorities mentioned mostly to highlight issues (perceived as problematic) or to contribute to the society?

### 1.5 Overview of the dissertation

In its entirety, this dissertation is divided into 6 chapters. The first chapter (introduction) consists of five sections. It commences by explaining the description of religious and ethnic minority population in Pakistan, then elaborates on the rationale of the study. It highlights the aim of the study following with the research questions and ends with the overview of the studies.

Chapter 2 elucidates the theoretical concepts of Critical Discourse Analysis and the various functions it performs. It also highlights the use of language in newspaper media and the social construction theories affecting people's cognitive perception of minorities. The review of the empirical studies using critical discourse analysis of newspaper contents in Pakistani context is provided to derive the research gap. Research questions are then enumerated to fill in the gap detected in the body of previous research.

Chapter 3 elaborates the methodology of the study and includes sample selection. It elaborates the rationale behind each decision made. It also explains the critical framework of indicators eclectically derived to detect the representation of ethnic and religious minorities of Pakistan.

Chapter 4 discusses the significant findings of each research question through the tabulation of occurrences via quantitative content analysis, which is supported via a critical discourse analysis of quintessential excerpts of the three newspapers explaining how these indicators reveal marginalisation and misrepresentation of minorities.

Chapter 5 discusses these findings and establishes a connection to the literature already reviewed. Chapter 6 concludes the dissertation and summarises some recommendations for the media censorship authorities to implement in order to curb the perpetuation of stereotypical in-group and out-group binaries. Suggestions of some pedagogical implications at the tertiary level for instructors are outlined. Finally, future research implications in multiple disciplines are proposed.

## 2. Literature Review

This chapter will begin by elucidating the concept of CDA. First the definition of the process will be presented followed by its various functions. Later, some of the basic constructs that are studied in the process, particularly involving language in the newspaper media will be elaborated. Afterward, the constructs that affect social cognition of groups and the functions CDA text analysis performs will be enumerated. Thirdly, cognitive theories that affect the perception of readers through media exposure will be extrapolated and studies on detecting effects of marginalisation of ethnic and religious minorities on the perception of readers in the news media will be reviewed to establish the significance of the topic. Lastly, CDA studies conducted on the contents of Pakistani newspapers will be reviewed to unearth the research gap that the current study aims to fill. The chapter concludes by reiterating the research questions within the context of this gap.

### 2.1 Definition and functions of Critical Discourse Analysis:

**Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)** is defined as the “type of discourse analytical research that primarily studies the way social power abuse, dominance and inequality are enacted, reproduced and resisted by text and talk in the social and political context” (Van Dijk, 1998, p.1). Instead of highlighting latest fads and fashions, it focuses on social and political issues that are pertinent and historical (Van Dijk, 1998) The functions of CDA enumerated by Fairclough and Wodak (1997) are diverse as it highlights societal issues, and examines the power imbalances in discourse. CDA inspects discourse holistically including societal and cultural factors. Another important function of CDA is to study discourse as an instrument of constructing ideology based on historical, social, and cultural context of the text. Thus, CDA also acts as a mediator between text and society. It analyses and interprets text and utterances while the explanation of CDA functions as a means of social action (Van Dijk, 1998).

CDA studies are based on the premise that language, as a social practice is the central pivot of a communities social life (Hernández, 2008). This paradigm is largely concerned with highlighting certain social situations and to analyse them on the basis of linguistic evidence (Hernández, 2008). Hence,

linguists and analysts are not just concerned with studying the lexical structures per se, but indulge in the analysis to the extent of understanding and dilation of a particular social situation (Fairclough & Wodak, 2001). Consequently, CDA analysts delve deeper than just the description and interpretation of discourse by engaging in debates on political and social issues to contribute to the society (Davies et al., 1996; Fairclough, 2003; Mills, 2004).

Therefore, CDA is a genre of identifying social hierarchies and the analysis not only scrutinises linguistic structures or units, but highlights the underlying pervasive social inequalities propagated through the text (Wodak & Meyer, 2001). After identification of the social problem, “they intend to unfold/clarify/reveal the tensions underlying such a situation in order to make it more transparent, and thus understandable” (Hernández, 2008, p.228). The linguistic structural analysis in CDA was instituted by Halliday (1994). Hernández (2008) explains that Halliday takes a functional perspective of linguistics that is governed by its relation to society. Hence, functional grammar offers the appropriate tools for a linguistic analysis needed for CDA (Hernández, 2008).

## 2.2 Nominalisation and Passivisation in CDA:

Another grammatical function that Fairclough (2003) and Fowler (1991) have coined for critical discourse analysis is the process of *nominalisation* and *passivisation*. According to Fairclough (1992), the concept of nominalisation is “the conversion of a clause into a nominal or noun” (p. 27). He explains further that nominalisation, along with ‘passivisation’, “may be associated with ideologically significant features of texts such as the systematic mystification of agency; both allow the agent of a clause to be deleted” (Billig, 2008, p.789).

However, the use of nominalisation and passivation has faced much criticism from the recent linguists of CDA. Billig (2008) argues that both the founding fathers of these terms are guilty of passivisation themselves. Since these terms are themselves a product of the conversion of verbs into noun phrases and the deletion of the agencies who commit these actions, hence their inclusion as a detector of CDA may seem principally wrong. However, Billig (2008) seems to commit circular reasoning because the terminology per se is self-indicative of the process it represents, so it is logical to name them as *nominalisation* and *passivisation*. The miscommunication these two processes cause by removing the state elite actors and institutions in newspapers contents to avoid public backlash or litigation against their actions committed towards religious or ethnic minorities make them significant detectors (Van Dijk, 2008).

Usually, the newspapers indulge in passivisation to avoid and secure themselves from taking any responsibility to avoid any lawsuits against content contention especially if influential and powerful majorities are involved in comparison to the minorities. Passivisation is mostly achieved through rearranging the syntax of the clause. Therefore, the newspaper is able to imply illegal conduct without making an accusation that could cause them certain legal repercussions (Widdowson, 2007).

To comprehend the process of passivisation comprehensively, it is essential to understand the sentence structure and how it can be rearranged, or the omissions of certain agents can mislead to misinterpretation. Action verbs are another means of language that can form social structures.

According to Nemickienė (1977, p.36), “[t]he order of elements in a clause can give weighting to some aspects, and reduce, or remove others. The relationship between the elements has a fundamental role. The verbs which occupy a major role in newspapers message.” The verb system divided the verbs into two categories, those that refer to actions are actional, and those that refer to relations are called relational.

Actional verbs are further divided into transitive and intransitive. Transitive verbs have an agent or actor who causes the action, and someone or something is affected by the action. While the other actional verbs, for example, ‘slept’, ‘went’, ‘swim’ involve only the actor. Such verbs are called intransitive (Kress & Hodge, 1993). To illustrate and understand the usage of the intransitive verbs in some headlines of The Sun, (2010) and of The Independent (2010) are as follows, “The ex-supermodel weighs ten stone’. ‘Madonna is a mum!’ Word obese is too offensive. Quality or attribute: That dog is vicious. Equal state: David is my brother” (Nemickienė, 1977, p.36)

Since the functions pointed out by Fairclough & Wodak (2001) and Van Dijk (1998) entail social issues, it becomes necessary to understand and clarify how social cognition is perceived and defined in critical discourse studies. Furthermore, the explanation of the mental and social processes involved, and their definitions becomes crucial to better comprehend the concept of CDA, and the derivation of its framework in the present study.

### 2.3 Social Cognition:

As CDA focuses on power, domination, and social inequality, naturally it involves groups, organisations, and institutions. CDA also needs to study the social cognition of “social collectivities: knowledge, attitudes, ideologies, norms and values” (Van Dijk, 1998, p. 4). He further posits that mental and social representations are still a relatively untraversed field albeit a lot of books have been written on it.

Van Dijk (1998) explains that social representation is a consequence of ‘mental models’ and these models are articulated through written texts and talks. However, it is a two-way process as this daily discourse in the form of dialogues, news reports textbooks also shape our knowledge of the world, our socially shared attitudes and finally our ideologies and fundamental norms and values. These power dynamics of groups is affected and can get affected by their discourse (Van Dijk, 1998). So, social representation is collectively shared by groups of people, and the ‘mental models’ in turn are the specific instances of these social representations.

Having defined social cognition, it is imperative to comprehend the basic components of CDA to understand its procedure and mechanisms. In CDA, linguists mainly analyse excerpts of texts. Fairclough (1996; 2010) divides text analysis in three levels:

1. Deeper investigation of linguistic forms which consists of analysis of vocabulary, grammar, cohesion, and text structure.
2. The second level examines the force of utterances, coherence, and intertextuality of the text.
3. Sociocultural analysis: examination of the power relations predominant in society. Sociocultural analysis also unearths the hegemonic struggle of the members of that society and an imbalance of power relations will proliferate, reform, and confront the prevalent hegemonies.

CDA has evolved diversely by the amalgamation of various approaches and disciplines. Fairclough advocates combining “linguistically oriented discourse analysis and social and political thought relevant to discourse and language, in the form of a framework which will be suitable for use in social scientific research, and specifically in the study of social change” (Fairclough, 1992, p. 62). Furthermore, it is argued that discourse is both socially dependent and conditioned (Fairclough & Wodak, 2001). Even though societal members are oblivious to the network of social structures, social practices and hegemonic relations prevalent, their actions affect the social setup and impact the societal struggles in which they dwell (Fairclough, 1992).

As CDA predominantly focuses on detecting power imbalances in discourse, coherence, and intertextuality, it becomes crucial to understand how these social structures and social struggles marginalise ethnic and religious minorities especially through the news media particularly in the newspapers.

## **2.4 Ethnic and religious minorities and the News Media:**

A plethora of studies have been conducted to detect the marginalisation of ethnic minorities in the news media through content analysis. Since its inception in the 70's, CDA and content analysis have shown that the news media displays partialities to the elite classes and portray the minority groups in less favorable fashion (Van Dijk, 1991, 1993, 2015; Kroonenberg & Veer, 1980). Ethnic minorities are mainly mentioned in the news for negative issues mostly for illicit activities such as drugs, crime, violence, and evictions (Van Dijk, 1987, 1991).

### **2.4.1 Dominant group hegemony *us* versus *them* polarization:**

In order to maintain the power of dominant groups in the social hierarchy, white elites cultivate a positive representation of their own and propagate a negative portrayal of the ethnic minorities (Van Dijk, 1993). So, the news predominantly covers topics regarding minorities that are problematic per se different, deviant or threatening to the dominant groups (Van Dijk, 1993). In the western context, the refugees or immigrants are mostly portrayed as the root cause of several problems and their large numbers –a source of concern for the white majority groups. The news focuses on the topics of ‘immigration rackets’ and ‘economic refugees’ who are reported to be “living of our [white majorities] pockets” (p. 278). Van Dijk (1993) further explains, “ethnic minorities themselves hardly have a voice in the news: Competent and critical minority experts, especially those specialized in ethnic affairs, tend to be ignored, marginalised, discredited, or even attacked in the White press” (p. 254).

However, all newspaper reporting can be generalized under one banner and differences between the liberal and conservative publishing houses where the later take a much less sympathetic attitude towards the ethnic minorities.

These findings have led Van Dijk to conclude that newspapers are responsible for a continued process of polarization between “us” and “them.” This, in turn, may lead readers to believe that ethnic immigration, and the presence of ethnic minorities as such, pose a threat to society as a whole and to certain social groups in particular.

(Lubbers et al., 2010, p. 129)

## **2.5 Theories on media exposure and studies on perception of ethnic threat highlighting significance of the topic**

### **2.5.1 Gerbner’s Cultivation Theory**

Studies have shown that exposure to the media portraying ethnic and religious minorities or certain marginalised groups in a particular light affects people’s perception and attitudes towards them. *Cultivation theory* of cultural indicators is based on the effects of television on people’s attitudes towards certain segments of the society (Gerbner & et al., 1977). This seminal research initiated later researchers to follow suit. Gerbner’s *cultivation theory* states that “exposure influences people to perceive the world in a certain manner”(Escoffery, 2006, p.136). Research emanating from this theory has faced much criticism. Bulck (1995); Potter, (1993); Stilling (1997) criticized Gerbner’s research for having some methodological inconsistencies. The measurement of exposure to television was not very accurate in terms

of number of hours, and instead was just categorized in the research as light or heavy. Potter (1993) and Hirsch (1980) were skeptical about the attribution of cause. They were uncertain of the resulting attitude towards minorities, either it was an effect of exposure to entertainment and functional content on television, or it was a social phenomenon or an influence of both. However, later research rectified their designs to overcome the flaws and confounding variables indicated. It was not the general exposure to television that instilled such perceptions of ethnic minorities as threats, but the exposure to certain commercial TV content (Lubbers & Scheepers, 2010), entertainment, and functional content propagated hatred towards ethnic minorities (Vergeer et al., 1996). These studies found strong evidence of the *cultivation theory* proposed by Gerbner.

Similarly, Lubbers & Scheepers (2010) proposed that newspapers have a profound effect on perceptions about ethnic minorities as they are a significant source of information. These papers portray the ethnic minorities as potential threats to the society, so based on 'Gerbner's theory of cultivation' it becomes imperative to understand whether these newspapers, like television programs also cultivate negative perceptions against the minorities. But it would be a generalization to contemplate that all the newspapers incite negative perceptions against ethnic minorities. Exposure to only certain television programs instill negative sentiments, and like television, newspapers largely differ (Van Dijk, 1993). So, certain newspapers of a particular school of thought belonging to a certain lobby would inculcate negative acuties, thus, different newspapers will affect people's perception differently.

## **2.6 Alternative explanations for the perception of ethnic threats:**

It has been observed through earlier sociological research that the degree of perception of viewing ethnic minorities as a threat varies and is subjective to different social groups. There are two theories elucidating the phenomenon:

### **2.6.1 Social Identity theory:**

According to Tajfel (1982), every individual has an inherent need to belong to a social group which allows the individual to conform to the values and beliefs of that particular group also considered as the in-group. On the other hand, individuals and groups, who have contrasting belief systems, are professed negatively as the out-groups. As a result, individuals are positively inclined towards the in-groups and negatively or unfavourably inclined towards the out-groups. These mental inclinations are known as ethnocentrism (Billiet et al., 1996; Pieterse et al., 1993; Scheepers et al., 1997; Smootha, 1987).

### **2.6.2 Realistic Conflict Theory:**

A theory coined by researchers Levine & Campbell (1972) proposes that in the acquisition of scarce necessities social groups have to compete with each other and resultantly develop a conflict of interest. In situations where underprivileged members of in-groups need to compete with ethnic minorities, they feel threatened by the ethnic out-groups because of the fear of losing their livelihood. Research has revealed that the demographically underprivileged, less educated, low status occupational people are more susceptible to perceive ethnic minorities as threat (Lubbers et al., 2010).

Thus, Lubbers & Scheepers (2010) concluded that people exposed to one newspaper are more likely to be influenced by ethnocentrism as compared to people exposed to multiple newspapers. Also, as mentioned above, the less educated and lower income groups with less exposure to multiple newspapers are prone to be a target of such mental processes.

### **2.6.3 Highlighting Significance of the topic:**

Applying the Realistic Conflict Theory to Pakistan, a country having a population of predominantly young



young, less educated, low status people would be affected by ethnocentrism and perceive the ethnic minorities as threats to their livelihood and sustenance. Therefore, the study portends to examine the misrepresentation of ethnic minorities in the newspapers which affect the mental processes of the people. Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart (2009) conducted a time analysis study from 1993-2005 on the effects on attitudes of people regarding the immigrants before and after three main events to Germany. They analysed the content of articles on anti-immigration from three German daily newspapers to substantiate the following hypotheses:

H1: The visibility of ethnic minority actors in the news positively affects anti-immigration attitudes.

H2: Positive evaluations of ethnic actors in the news negatively affect anti-immigration attitudes, while negative evaluations positively affect anti-immigration attitudes.

H3: The impact of news content on anti-immigration attitudes is moderated by real world factors. The higher the immigration level, the number of asylum applications or the unemployment rate, the stronger the impact of media content on anti-immigration attitudes.

H4: The visibility of immigration issues in the news positively affects anti-immigration attitude.

(Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart, 2009, pp. 521-522)

The findings indicated the readers perceived immigrant actors/immigration issues as less problematic if they were covered in newspapers frequently. However, the readers' attitude either positive or negative was dependent on the content and context in which the immigrant actors were presented. Researchers conducted the analysis of German newspapers read by most of the German people comprising of a wide range of demographics: diverse age groups, different educational backgrounds, and varied income groups. Since German is the only language used by both the lower and highly educated classes in Germany, readers perceptions irrespective of their educational background, income range, and age were affected over time disproving the point raised by (Lubbers et al., 2010). The findings establish the significance of the topic—reading news content misrepresenting or portraying the minorities as an out-group has adverse effects on the readers' perception irrespective of their diverse demographic background.

Another factor which makes it a potent topic, is the inculcation of violence against the out-group ethnic minorities by the in-group if newspapers portray violence against the out-group ethnic minorities by the in-group right wingers. It was demonstrated by Koopmans & Olzak (2004) study. They used a cross sectional and a time series design methodology. Their findings revealed that differential visibility and the support for political right-wing violence significantly increased incidents of violent acts against different ethnic minorities target groups in Germany.

Psychological studies have also observed that people's perception are moulded by stereotypes specifically the categorisation of certain traits within group rather than between groups. Oliver (1999) conducted an experimental study in which it was revealed that Caucasian people would perceive an African American as the culprit even though a Caucasian was presented as the culprit in a news story. Since the participants' cognitive process were socially conditioned to affiliating the trait of crime with Afro-Americans, it led them to indicate an Afro-American instead of the Caucasian as the culprit in delayed recognition tests (Oliver, 1999).

Similarly, a research conducted in Pakistan through a questionnaire survey on the impact of news headlines of three major news channels of Pakistan. Hassan (2018) used Fairclough's Framework to qualitatively analyse 608 headlines in conjunction with an online survey from 100 viewers to reveal that the news channels instilled varying ideologies and power relations in the people's minds.

Moreover, newspaper content having a readership of millions and has the impact of creating stereotypes regarding certain ethnic minorities through ethnocentrism. Liu (2004) conducted a corpus analysis of 857 newspaper articles of four major newspapers of Australia. The researcher found through corpus analysis that Chinese were mostly portrayed as ‘illegal immigrants’ even though they had migrated to the continent centuries ago with the English. They were mostly perceived as ‘ordinary people’ or as ‘authoritarian leaders’ involved in illicit activities to gain visas. Rather than creating an interethnic harmony these portrayals created stereotypical perception of the Chinese Australians as the out-group and inferior to the in-group white population. Even if the Chinese Australians were in positions of power, they were portrayed using their power unlawfully.

## 2.7 Overview of CDA studies on newspaper contents conducted in Pakistan

The intention for opting for qualitative analysis employing NVivo software as a research design for conducting CDA will be evident after reviewing and critically analysing the studies undertaken. The review of literature of CDA studies conducted on Pakistan English Newspapers is to contextualise and derive relevant interpretations for the research design. The review will also aid in deriving a critical framework of indicators for the present study.

Bilal et al. (2012) used two newspapers editorials and chose three articles from each newspaper (N=6) as their sample size to conduct a Critical Discourse Analysis. Their analysis used Van Dijk’s (1998) critical framework for detecting construction of ideologies and difference in perspectives of the left wing and right-wing papers in a cross-sectional study covering three instances. The three instances reported at the time by both *Dawn* and *Nawa-i-Waqt*. Researchers concluded that ideology construction was manifested by the daily *Nawa-i-Waqt* as compared to *Dawn* that indulged in more objective reporting. However, the study’s sample size was a limitation. By analyzing six articles on only three issues is an inadequate sample size that may question the representativeness to depict the ideology or perspective of both the publishing houses. Moreover, Bilal et al. (2012) solely employed qualitative analysis and the lack of incorporation of another instrument to triangulate the findings points towards a gap.

Sajjad (2013) conducted a CDA of 20 news headlines randomly selected about Imran Khan’s peace march towards Waziristan. The aim of the study was to investigate the difference between the portrayal of the same news item between foreign and local English newspapers to unearth the hidden ideologies propagated by their editors or publishing houses. Sajjad (2013) adopted Van Dijk’s and Olowe’s techniques for analysis of newspaper headlines to investigate four of their lexical components i.e. passivisation, topicalization, information, and evaluation. Out of the four aspects chosen, the most convincing indicator was that of *Passivisation* as it was easily and directly decipherable through the passive sentences employed in the news headlines. The remaining three were more of a subjective interpretation on part of the researcher thus open to criticism and less indicative of editor’s ideology perpetuation.

Mahmood et al. (2014) investigated through CDA and corpus analysis the use of figurative language employed by four Pakistani English Newspapers in their four genres of newspaper content; Top News, National, Opinion, and Editorial. The aim was to highlight the implicit manipulation of readers through the employment of four predominantly used rhetorical devices; metonymies, metaphors, hyperboles and similies as framed by Richardson (2007). The findings revealed that the most frequently occurring figure of speech was metonymy through which the actors were replaced by the product, the object replaces the user, work place replacing the people working, dates replacing the events and citizens replacing the state

or nation (Richardson, 2007). It was revealed that metonymy affects readers' perception most significantly as it creates ambiguity and hides the agents of the news. Thus, metonymy seems an indicator that can be more indicative in terms of misrepresentation or underrepresentation of ethnic and religious minorities. In comparison, metaphors were less frequently used than metonymy but employed more often than simile or hyperbole.

Similarly, Khan et al. (2018) also conducted a CDA for the detection of rhetorical devices used in three English newspapers of Pakistan; *The News International*, *The Nation*, and *Dawn* editorials (N=36). A mixed method analysis i.e. both quantitative and qualitative methods were employed. The results revealed that the editorial writers employed eight rhetorical devices. Metonymy was most frequently used as it was also witnessed by Mahmood et al. (2014) and Farrokhi & Nazemi (2015). Hyperbole was the second most frequently used in contrast to the previous study in which metaphors were the second most frequently used device. Rhetorical questions were the third most frequently used while the rest of the devices namely: parallelism, antithesis, simile, metaphor, and neologism. Though Khan et al. (2018) used purposive sampling to focus on the news on Panama leaks which could otherwise be considered being subjective, it was an appropriate decision on their part as the use of random sampling would not have focused on the topic of Panama leaks. To triangulate their findings, they quantitatively calculated the significance of the difference through the Chi square of the frequencies.

The use of rhetorical devices especially metonymy, hyperbole and metaphors are employed to construct and perpetuate ideologies as witnessed by Fartousi & Dumanig (2012) in *The New Strait Times of Malaysia*; Bonyadi & Samuel (2013) in a contrastive analysis between *Tehran Times* and *The New York Times*. Farrokhi & Nazemi (2015) also conducted a contrastive analysis between *The New York Times* and *The Australian* and discovered similar results regarding the use of rhetorical devices for constructing perspectives, and to persuade their readers. As metonymy is predominantly used to persuade readers and perpetuate marginalisation, this paper will also include metonymy as an indicator of marginalisation of the religious and ethnic minorities.

Ali (2017) investigated the construction of polarities of us versus *them* in editorials written during the regional conflict between India and Pakistan over the Kashmir Issue. The unrest of 2016 was selected and the editorials (N=18) written between July to November were chosen from one of the leading newspapers *The News International* for scrutinisation using Van Dijk's (1995) theoretical framework. The analysis revealed that the other actors of the situation implying India and the UN, who were not taking any major steps, were subject to *otherisation* and were mostly depicted negatively. While the state, and its agents were shown in positive light and the action of Pakistani forces was mitigated and often in an intergroup identity as 'we' or 'us'. The juxtaposition of both 'us' versus 'them' propagates ideological functions. According to Fairclough et al. (2004), the 'we' group identity is presented by such words as 'we', 'us' or 'ours' and is also used to marginalise the ethnic minority groups of a state. Hence, their inclusion as a detector also is clearly indicative of the misrepresentation of minorities' experience.

Seyal & Hassan (2017) conducted a mixed method CDA analysis of three English newspapers *The News*, *The Nation* and *Dawn*. News stories for a period of three months on indigenous people (tribal) representation in the mainstream society through media depiction were selected. Majority of the population of Pakistanis consider them as outlaws or as out-groups, and the researcher's owed this partly to the portrayal and propagation of the tribal as such in the newspaper media of Pakistan. This study quantitatively enumerated in 154 stories the instances of indigenous people coverage and the type of coverage (negative or positive) depicted through the topics of the news and the predominant tone

employed by the writers. The study also scrutinised the level of prominence of the stories. It was judged through the page number the stories were published on. Front page news was considered high prominence, and news published on the rest of the pages was considered as low prominence. Only 54 out of 154 stories made headline news while the rest were given low prominence. The researchers triangulated their findings by qualitatively interviewing 24 Journalists of these newspapers to question them about news selection criteria. Out of the 24 journalists, 12 believed indigenous people had news value. Whereas out the remaining twelve, 37.4 % said they had no news value. Some journalists were unaware about the code of conduct regarding indigenous people. It was also not specified by the researchers. Even though the study covered ethnic minorities, it did not include religious minorities in their sample selection. Conducting interviews of the journalists was not as convincing a research design for a qualitative analysis since the reporters are also bound by the vested interests of their newspapers. Journalists may be restricted and influenced by the policies of the publication houses they work for, hence diminishing their credibility as sources.

An overview of the studies undertaken on the contents of Pakistani newspapers critically evaluated above are tabulated in Table B:

**Table B: Overview of the CDA studies on the contents of Pakistani newspapers**

| No | Title   | Methodology   | Author                    |
|----|---|---|---------------------------|
| 1  | Role of Media in Constructing Pakistani National Identity with reference to War on Terror, USA and Afghanistan.   | Incorporates quantitative content analysis of Pakistani indigenous newspapers to study the news about the war on terror.  | (Saeed & Rahman, 2019)    |
| 2  | Identity Constructions Through Media Discourses: Malala Yousafzai in Pakistani English newspapers.                | Uses CDA to study the news on the topic selecting two English newspapers. Applies the Fairclough’s three dimensional model for qualitative analysis.  | (Qazi & Shah, 2018)       |
| 3  | Discourse and Rhetoric: A Study of Pakistani English Newspaper Editorials.  | Quantitative analysis of three English newspaper editorials selected through purposive sampling to detect the usage of rhetorical devices in editorials written on the topic of Panama Leaks.   | (Khan et al., 2018)       |
| 4  | Critical Discourse Analysis of PM N. Sharif’s UNOGA Discourse Deciphering Covert Rhetoric—Dialectical Perspective | Qualitatively analysis of the correlation between text, elements of power, and ideology reflected in PM’s political discourse from dialectical perspective. It employs CDA based on “social critique and transformative action for change on a critique of discourse” (Fairclough, 2015). | (Gill, F.; & Azhar, 2018) |

|    |  |  |                        |
|----|--|--|------------------------|
| 5  | The terror speaks: Inside Pakistan’s terrorism discourse and national action plan              | Engages a poststructuralist CDA unearthing the discrepancies in Pakistan’s discourse on terrorism and practice.  | (Sahill, 2018)         |
| 6  | Representation of Indigenous People in Pakistan  | This study uses a mixed method analysis by employing both quantitative and qualitative analysis of the representation of indigenous people of Pakistan in three English newspapers of Pakistan. Researchers also qualitatively analysed telephonic interviews. | (Hassan & Seyal, 2017) |
| 7  | Discursive Reproduction of Ideology in the National Elite Press of Pakistan.                   | CDA following Van Dijk’s theoretical frame work of ‘ideological square’ to emphasize the positive-self representation and negative –other representation especially of the neighbouring country India.   | (Ali, 2017)            |
| 8  | A Critical Discourse Analysis of Figurative Language in Pakistani English Newspapers           | CDA of four English newspapers for figurative language using Richardson (2007) model of newspaper evaluation.  | (Mahmood et al., 2014) |
| 9  | Critical Discourse Analysis of News Headline about Imran Khan’s Peace March towards Waziristan | The study uses CDA to scrutinise the headlines of local English newspapers regarding Imran Khan’s peace march before the time of his premiership.  | (Sajjad, 2013)         |
| 10 | Editorials of Pakistani English Pint Media: Application of CDA                                 | Researchers incorporated CDA based on Van Dijk’s (1998) theoretical framework to identify and explain how ideology is constructed and presented through language used in two Pakistani newspapers.   | (Bilal et al., 2012)   |

## 2.8 Research Gap

It is evident from Table B that there has been no study conducted on the topic of ethnic and religious minorities’ representation in the print media of Pakistani newspapers. Apart from Seyal (2017), who incorporates mixed method analysis, none of the studies have employed mixed method analysis using NVivo software. Hence, the research questions that have not been explored so far are outlined in the next section.

## 2.9 Research Questions

After reviewing the literature on CDA studies performed on Pakistani English newspapers, the questions that seem most pertinent and less convincingly probed particularly regarding religious and ethnic minori-

ties are the focus of the present research. They are reiterated as follows:

1. Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major Newspapers?
2. Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as out-groups in the newspaper content?
3. How are the images/photographs in Newspapers positioning ethnic minorities in moments of protests or violence?
4. Are the violent images against ethnic minorities inducing violent acts against them?
5. Are the actions taken against the minorities represented by nominalisation, passivisation, and through metonymy in the newspaper contents and headlines?
6. What type of language i.e. positive/negative used to discuss ethnic religious minorities in Pakistan?
7. Are the minorities mentioned mostly to highlight issues (perceived as problematic) or to contribute to the society?

### 3. Methodology

The chapter begins with the rationale of combining quantitative and qualitative/mixed method analysis. The critical framework of indicators is presented explaining the reason behind the selection of each indicator. The rationale of selection of the three newspapers is also explained substantiated with a brief history of each publication house i.e. *Dawn*, *The Nation*, and *Pakistan Today*. Afterward, the sample size and number of articles selected from each genre of the three newspapers is elaborated. The chapter ends with the explanation of the group of nodes that answers each research question.

The methodology adopted for the present study is derived from the literature reviewed. To ensure triangulation of findings, a combination of a qualitative and a quantitative analysis through NVivo software is adopted. The corpus of the past three years of newspaper content of three major newspapers of Pakistan; *Dawn*, *Pakistan Today*, and *The Nation* is scrutinised. The reason behind opting for a quant-qual mixed method analysis was not only to triangulate but also to control the factor of subjectivity that has been the focus of criticism against CDA studies. Within the corpus, a purposive sampling technique was employed to include content that covered only ethnic and religious minorities—the focus of the study. In order to nullify the researcher’s bias associated with a purposive sample selection, a comprehensive selection of all genres of contents published in the last three years were selected i.e. Hard news (daily news), editorials, opinion pieces, columns, blogs and articles written in the respective papers’ magazines written on the topic were all encompassed. This systematic approach circumvented possibilities of the researcher subconsciously selecting only certain types of news stories, topics, and genres.

#### 3.1 Rationale of Combining Qualitative with Quantitative:

CDA is concerned with the correlation between language and ideology (Fairclough, 2001; Wodak & Meyer, 2001). CDA deals with “language as discourse and is a means of social practice” (Fairclough, 2001, p 21). Although CDA consists of a systematic analysis divided over three stages, it has had to face some criticism for its methodological shortcomings. The main concern for the scepticism is its sole reliance on qualitative methodological approach of critical linguistic analysis (Cheng, 2015). Fowler (1996, p.8) criticises the outcome of its analysis as mostly “fragmentary [and] exemplificatory” since the context and the method is overlooked as observed in critical analyses of various text genres. Other linguists point out the lack of academic thoroughness because of its subjectivity resulting from the analysts’ biases and presumptions (Widdowson, 1996). Another criticism raised by critics is the inability to draw

generalisations from CDA analysis because of its randomly selected sample size that lacks representativeness as the linguistic features are rarely compared with norms in the language (Orpin, 2005). To overcome these shortcomings of CDA, Stubbs (1997) suggests the incorporation of a quantitative type of analysis to support CDA, such as corpus methodology. It is easier said than done to combine the qualitative process of CDA with a quantitative approach. Alternatively Cheng (2015) expresses, the scrutinisation of lexical and grammatical choices to communicate the social issues and the phenomena affecting them. She further explains that CDA also examines the quantitative corpus analysis/linguistics used for examining, “lexogrammatical and collocational patterns of lexical items” (Cheng, 2015, p. 2). According to Orpin (2005), decisions need to be made about, “which aspects of the CDA approach can be best served by corpus analysis” and “to find a point or points of entry into the data” (pp. 38–9). Thus, a quantitative content analysis method was used to supplement the CDA approach. Content analysis is a common social research and corpus method which concerns itself with capturing the frequency with which certain content, elements or linguistic elements appear in texts. These frequency counts can be used to broadly explore the prevalence of elements of interest in the texts, before CDA is then applied to understand these elements in further detail.

Hence, the points of entry decided for the present study after reviewing the literature and the context of Pakistan. The detectors derived for conducting a critical discourse analysis are elaborated in the next section.

### 3.2 Critical Framework for detecting minority representation and discrimination:

Critical frameworks for detecting minority representation and discrimination of different studies were scrutinised through the literature reviewed and the content of the sample newspapers. An eclectic combination of indicators were adopted keeping in view the kind of news religious and ethnic minorities are represented and covered for in the newspapers of Pakistan. Accordingly, the context was incorporated in which the news is published to overcome the criticism raised by Fowler (1999). The choice of indicators finalized to be qualitatively and quantitatively analysed:

- The in-group versus out-group: *us* versus *them/they/their*
- Majorities versus the minorities in elite roles: representing power position or depicting influential status
- Minorities depicted in educated and talented roles versus the majorities occupying such roles
- Minorities mentioned in Low status occupations and dwelling in slums versus majorities shown as such
- Positive mentions of majorities versus positive mentions of minorities
- Assuring images for minorities versus disturbing images for minorities
- Cultural events covered of majorities versus cultural events covered of minorities
- Minorities mentioned to highlight issues versus minorities mentioned to contribute to society
- Nominalisation and passivisation of majority actors in news headlines versus minority actors
- Rhetorical devices used; metonymy, nominalisation, and passivisation employed to misrepresent or marginalise minorities

### 3.3 Research Procedure

Three English daily newspapers were selected *Dawn*, *Pakistan Today* and *The Nation*. The selection of these newspapers was made to overcome a subjective bias of perspective. A brief history of each

newspaper is explained to acquire an insight into each of the publication houses' editorial policy and the reasons for their inclusion.

### 3.3.1 Dawn

Daily *Dawn* is one of the pioneers of newspapers publishing in Pakistan. Pakistan Herald Publications founded in 1941 and now known as the Dawn Group of publications was founded by Mohammad Ali Jinnah. Its flagship publication—the Daily *Dawn* was first published in 1947. It is the second most widely read newspaper with a circulation of 109,000 (Shah, 2010). Amongst the press media, *Dawn* is perceived as a credible source of information having an international readership because of its e-paper version. Mezzera & Sial (2010, p.16) express, “[it] is regularly followed by representatives of the international community and by ‘policy and decision-makers in the public and private sectors’”. The daily *Dawn* was a Karachi based newspaper initially but later expanded its offices in all the major cities of Pakistan. The editorial policy of the paper is perceived as one of the most liberal and leftist. The publishing house has endeavored to follow and interpret the vision of Jinnah and is deemed to keep its approach secular and progressive about social issues concerning the state (Mezzera & Sial, 2010).

### 3.3.2 The Nation

On the other hand, *The Nation* is Lahore based and is owned by the Nawa-i-Waqt group which was founded in 1940. In 2000, they have started publishing from Karachi too and the capital city-Islamabad. It was owned by Hameed Nizami—one of the founding fathers of journalism in Pakistan after his death his brother is running the group (*NAWAIWAQT GROUP*, n.d.). The publication house is contemplated to possess conservative right wing political tendencies based on staunch Islamic ideology (Mezzera & Sial, 2010). Moreover, the general perception is, “*The Nation* is the most widely read by the right-wing public” (Qazi & Shah, 2018, p.1600). Nevertheless, it also has international readership after the introduction of its e-paper.

### 3.3.3 Pakistan Today

*Pakistan Today* founded in 2010 by Arif Nizami, son of Hameed Nizami of Nawa-i-Waqt group is a recent addition to the Pakistani press scene, and it also has its e-newspaper since inception thus has international penetration. It is a part of Lahore-based Nawa Media Corporation formed by the owner in 2008 to create a separate identity for himself. The daily *Pakistan Today* is known to uphold a moderate editorial policy consequently falling in the middle of the above two pioneering newspaper publications policies

### 3.3.4 Rationale for selection of the three newspapers

Daily's *Dawn* and *The Nation* were selected since each of the newspapers were based in two of the most populated provinces of Pakistan where most of the ethnic and religious minorities reside. Hence, making news coverage of minorities more likely. Additionally, they are both pioneers of print media and represent the most prestigious publication houses but with opposite didactic proclivities. On the other hand, inclusion of the daily *Pakistan Today* in the sample was to add a representative of a more contemporary newspaper by adding sample contents of a publication policy set in a recent time frame. *Pakistan Today* is also representative of a middle or moderate editorial policy, hence, it not only added diversity to the sample because of its recency, but its moderate editorial policy amplified diversity of the newspaper content samples and ensured generalisability of the research findings.

## 3.4 Data Collection: Sample Size for corpus of CDA

The contents of the past four years of each of the newspaper were scrutinized and news coverage pertaining to religious and ethnic minorities was included in the corpus for conducting a critical discourse analysis.



All the genres of news coverage were selected that contained news on the topic i.e. editorials, hard news, opinion pieces, magazine articles and photographs/images. An exact depiction of the number of texts selected from dailies *Dawn*, *The Nation*, and *Pakistan Today* is displayed in Table C.

**Table C: Displaying the number of texts selected from each genre from the three newspapers**

| Newspapers            | Editorials | Hard News | Opinion Pieces | Magazine Articles | Blogs                               |
|-----------------------|------------|-----------|----------------|-------------------|-------------------------------------|
| <i>Dawn</i>           | 17         | 14        | 5              | 7                 | 1                                   |
| <i>The Nation</i>     | 10         | 14        | 13             |                   | 1                                   |
| <i>Pakistan Today</i> | 10         | 9         | 11             | 6                 | Not written any in the last 3 years |
| <b>Total</b>          | 37         | 37        | 29             | 12                | 2                                   |

Contents belonging to different genres of each newspaper were divided in separate folders in NVivo with the file classification as: editorials, hard news, Op-eds, magazines and Blogs. The dailies *Dawn* and *Pakistan Today* have their respective magazines; *Herald* for the former and *The Dependent* for the later while *The Nation's* magazine is published in Urdu hence not selected.

### 3.5 Group of Nodes made to answer each Research Question

All the texts were then manually coded in NVivo by highlighting the indicators that were shortlisted for detecting the critical framework of indicating minority representation. The indicators were developed as nodes under codes while numbers under each node depicted the frequency of occurrence of that particular indicator. The nodes were then tabulated, and graphs were developed through Microsoft excel by grouping the nodes according to the research questions they answered. Nodes that were created and the research questions they responded to are elaborated in Table D.

**Table D: Group of Nodes answering each Research Question**

| S. No | Research Questions  | Nodes (MN=minorities) (MJ = majorities)  |
|-------|---|--|
| 1     | Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major Newspapers? | MJ in authoritarian roles<br>MN in authoritarian roles<br>MJ in influential roles<br>MN in influential roles<br>MJ in Low status jobs or living in slums<br>MN in Low status jobs or living in slums<br>MN in educated and qualified roles<br>MJ in educated and qualified roles |

|   |  |   |
|---|--|---|
| 2 | Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as ‘out-groups’ in the newspaper content?   | Them/they/them used for MJ<br>Them/they/them used for MN<br>We/us/my/our used for MJ<br>We/us/my/our used for MN  |
| 3 | How are the images/photographs in Newspapers positioning ethnic minorities in moments of protests or violence?<br>Are the violent images against ethnic minorities inducing violent acts against them? | Assuring images for MN<br>Disturbing images for MN  |
| 4 | Are the actions taken against the minorities represented by nominalisation, passivisation, and ‘metonymy’ in the newspaper contents and headlines?   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Nominalisation and passivisation for MJ</li> <li>• News Headlines using active voice for MJ</li> <li>• News Headlines using active voice for MN</li> <li>• Metonymy of MN</li> </ul> |
| 5 | What type of language i.e. positive/negative is used to discuss ethnic religious minorities in Pakistan?   | Negative words used for MJ<br>Negative words used for MN<br>Negative connotative words for MJ<br>Negative connotative words for MN<br>Positive words for MJ<br>Positive words for MN<br>Positive connotative words for MJ     |
| 6 | Are the minorities mentioned mostly to highlight issues (perceived as problematic) or to contribute to society?  | MN mentioned to highlight issues<br>MN mentioned to contribute to society<br>Cultural events mentioned of MN  |
| 7 | Are the actions taken against minorities highlighted or repressed?   | Authorities shown taking steps<br>Authorities misuse power  |

After tabulation of the grouped nodes, a direct depiction of the indicators was drawn through the comparison of numbers of each group of nodes occurrences. The comparison revealed if ethnic and religious minorities were being marginalised by the print media. To elaborate further, to reveal the findings

of research questions e.g. are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major newspapers? The tabulation and graphing of the following group of nodes was constructed as seen in Table 4:

- MJ in authoritarian roles
- MN in authoritarian roles
- MJ in influential roles
- MN in influential roles
- MJ in Low status jobs or living in slums
- MN in Low status jobs or living in slums
- MN in talented and qualified roles
- MJ in educated and qualified roles

The numbers of occurrence of these indicators and their direct comparison revealed the findings to the first research question. Similarly, the rest of the questions were also probed by the group of indicators/nodes as elucidated in Table 4. Finally, their outcomes were construed to unearth marginalisation of religious and ethnic minorities in the Dailies *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan Today*. Alongside quantitative content analysis, a qualitative critical discourse analysis was also presented by including illustrative excerpts from the contents of the newspapers for each of the questions. These are not intended to be representative, but instead are provided to add in-depth illustrations of the treatment of ethnic minorities within the various genres of newspapers. Next, the findings are extrapolated in the forthcoming chapter.

#### 4. Findings

Since group of indicators for the first research question were numerous (eight), the results of *Dawn*, *The Nation*, and *Pakistan Today* were described individually. The purpose of segregation was to scrutinize in detail excerpts of each indicator. While for the rest of the five research questions, the findings of the three newspapers have been combined as there were less number of indicators in each group thus easier to comprehend. Portions of excerpts displaying an indicator have been colour coded to highlight and differentiate them from the main text of the newspaper.

#### 4.1 Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major Newspapers?

##### 4.1.1 (Positions of Power in Daily *Dawn*)

Three tables display the findings of each newspaper genre to answer the first research question: Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as occupying positions of power in elite roles in the content of major newspapers? Table 1a elucidates if the minorities (MN) of Pakistan are occupying positions of power compared with the roles occupied by majorities (MJ) – their Muslim counterparts of daily *Dawn*. Eight indicators were selected for the depiction and comparison. The first being MJ in negative roles whereas the portrayal of MN in negative roles was not observed because the news contents of all genres were covering issues faced by minorities. A total of 5 occurrences were indicated: one in *The Herald Magazine* and 4 in *Dawn* Opinion pieces. Apart from one instance where the name of the perpetrator is mentioned, “Ali Raza, 23, exploited in kidnapping Monika, 12.” The rest are all generic references e.g. ‘mullahs’, ‘jihadist’. An example from a *Dawn* opinion piece with a generic mention is, “Mullahs incite mobs at regular intervals to torch churches and the homes of Christians.”

**Table 1a: Findings of RQ1 (Positions of Power in Daily: Dawn)**

| No | Newspapers       | MJ Negative Roles | MJ Influential Roles | MJ Authoritarian Roles | MJ Qualified Roles | MN Low Status Jobs-Slums | MN Qualified Roles | MN Authoritarian Roles | MN Influential Roles |
|----|------------------|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|----------------------|
| 1  | Dawn-Herald Mag  | 1                 | 6                    | 6                      | 5                  | 5                        | 0                  | 0                      | 8                    |
| 2  | Dawn Blogs       | 0                 | 0                    | 0                      | 0                  | 0                        | 0                  | 0                      | 0                    |
| 3  | Dawn Editorials  | 0                 | 8                    | 7                      | 0                  | 0                        | 0                  | 1                      | 2                    |
| 4  | Dawn Hard News   | 0                 | 30                   | 9                      | 10                 | 4                        | 2                  | 2                      | 15                   |
| 5  | Dawn (Op-ed)     | 4                 | 2                    | 6                      | 2                  | 1                        | 0                  | 2                      | 1                    |
| 6  | Total Indicators | 5                 | 46                   | 28                     | 17                 | 10                       | 2                  | 5                      | 26                   |

A comparison between influential roles revealed that MJ occurred 46 times as opposed to MN which were presented in influential roles 26 times only. These were the individuals of both MJ and MN who were trying to influence or could influence authorities.

Similarly, authoritarian roles (individuals occupying positions of power; police, senators, and members of parliament) were also dominated by MJ, and they appeared 28 times whereas MN were seen occupying authoritarian positions only 5 times. These 5 occurrences of MN were as ministers of parliament to represent minorities e.g. Punjab Minister for Human Rights and Minorities Affairs Ijaz Alam. Or as religious heads of minorities such as Archbishop Joseph Arshad or Bishop Emeritus of Lahore Dr. Alexander John Malik.

A contrast of qualified roles elaborating if minorities were presented as educated and skilled, revealed 17 occurrences of MJ versus 2 of MN. However, MN appeared 10 times as occupying low status jobs such as janitors, sweepers and living in slums whereas none of the MJ’s were shown working in low-status jobs as sweepers, janitors, and cleaners or living in impoverished conditions. MN were mentioned as “Romana, a Christian, also criticised organisations that believed Christians were there to work as cleaners and sweepers.” Or in another news as “Even 96pc, of 2.5pc, quota is filled with sanitary workers,” he said. In the examples above, Christian minorities are mentioned in low-status jobs such as cleaners, sweepers or sanitary workers. The portions of sentences have been colour coded to highlight the phrases.

**4.1.2 (Positions of Power in daily: The Nation)**

The analysis of contents of daily *The Nation* revealed that no one amongst MJ were portrayed in negative

roles – a result in concurrence to the findings of daily *Dawn* seen in Table 1b. However, a huge difference was observed in the findings between occurrences in influential roles of MJ and MN where MJ appeared in 53 occurrences while MN appeared in 9 occurrences. 8 of these occurrences are of the same PTI leader and Patron-in-Chief of Pakistan Hindu Council Dr. Ramesh Kumar Vankwani who is a PTI leader but only representing the Hindu minority. The other reference is of Sindh Minister for Minorities Affairs Hari Ram Kishori Lal who was considered in influential as well as in authoritarian roles, appearing in a capacity of representing minorities only.

**Table 1b: (Positions of Power in Daily: *The Nation*)**

| N O | Newspapers            | MJ Negative Roles | MJ Influential Roles | MJ Authoritarian Roles | MJ Qualified Roles | MN Low Status Jobs-Slums | MN Qualified roles | MN Authoritarian Roles | MN Influential Roles |
|-----|-----------------------|-------------------|----------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|----------------------|
| 1   | The Nation Editorials | 0                 | 18                   | 15                     | 0                  | 1                        | 0                  | 1                      | 1                    |
| 2   | The Nation (Op-ed)    | 0                 | 5                    | 6                      | 5                  | 0                        | 2                  | 0                      | 0                    |
| 3   | The Nation Hard News  | 0                 | 30                   | 4                      | 14                 | 0                        | 1                  | 0                      | 8                    |
| 4   | The Nation (Blog)     | 0                 | 0                    | 2                      | 3                  | 0                        | 0                  | 0                      | 0                    |
| 5   | Total Indicators      | 0                 | 53                   | 27                     | 22                 | 1                        | 3                  | 1                      | 9                    |

A comparison of the indicator of authoritarian roles in *The Nation* from Table 1b exposes the stark difference between the occurrences of MJ (n=27) versus MN (n=1). MN’s sole occurrence was without a name and only a title was mentioned in one of the editorials ‘Mainstreaming minorities’ which comments, “[i]n the 1950s, Pakistan’s Hindu Law Minister left Pakistan as did many Muslims who saw the forces of intolerance prevail.”

A contrast of the occurrence in qualified roles of MJ (n=22) and MN (n=3) reveals more occurrences in favour of MJ, the few times they do occur are, “Jennifer Jag Jivan of the Christian Study Centre.” The excerpt mentions a Christian woman qualified and working again at a Christian center and not in the mainstream work force. Nevertheless, in one of the Op-ed pieces of daily *The Nation* a positive mention of a qualified MN was found. It mentions:

Recently, the members of the Hindu community have started to join the Pakistan Army; Pakistan has appointed its first-ever Hindu officer - Dr Kelash Garvada – a Major in the Ministry of Defence.

*(Kashmir Crisis and the Role of Minorities, 2019)*

The last occurrence was a generic mention of MN playing a significant role in the past. “Christians have played a prominent role in the armed forces, education sector, health sector, judiciary among others.” There was a generic mention of MN in low status job as observed in an editorial in the following excerpt: Despite that concept of equality of laws and rules, federal and provincial departments in violation of the constitution continue to advertise menial and dirty jobs exclusively for non-Muslims. The absence of equal opportunities and a religious apartheid within the culture has driven most non-Muslims below the poverty line forcing them into menial occupations and forced labour. Living in ghettos, the communities are fast losing self-esteem.

*(Mainstreaming Minorities, 2015)*

The editorial, written by a Christian – Simon Sharaf, paints a true picture and evidently expresses that low status jobs (described as dirty and menial) are exclusively advertised for non-Muslims only. They are reduced to living in slums in the most impoverished conditions. However, no specific mentions of minorities occupying low status jobs are made. Since only one such mention occurred and not within the past three years, but earlier, it may seem that the conditions of minorities have improved. It is far from reality as witnessed from the occurrences in daily *Dawn*. It may be construed – *The Nation* did not consider portrayal of the minorities in underprivileged conditions newsworthy even though their circumstances have not enhanced over the years.

#### **4.1.3 (Positions of Power in Daily: *Pakistan Today*)**

As witnessed in the previous two papers MJ in negative roles did not occur. However, MJ in influential roles occurred in 35 instances while MN appeared 18 times (Table 1c) in such roles with examples like, “Dr Seema Fozdar representing the Baha’i community said “Pakistan’s minorities presented a beautiful mix of religions that needed tolerance and harmony for a peaceful society””(*Forced Conversions Un-Islamic, Says PM on Minority Day | Pakistan Today, 2019*).

One occurrence covered in the hard news was, “Isphanyar Bhandara speaking on behalf of Parsi community said “protection of minorities was linked with the country’s solidarity and urged the government to rename the major roads as earlier in the names of non-Muslims prominent personalities””(*Forced Conversions Un-Islamic, Says PM on Minority Day | Pakistan Today, 2019*).

In each one of these examples, the representative members of minorities are struggling to influence the authorities to adopt a specific plan of action; Dr Seema Fozdar is urging the government and MJ’s to be tolerant of MN for gaining peace – a dire need under the circumstances. In the second occurrence, Isphanyar Bhandara is insisting to rename major roads after MN thus to improve solidarity and implicate that minorities have equal rights in Pakistan as the majorities.

In an opinion piece “Ethnic cleansing’ of Hazara Shias must stop” an occurrence highlights, “a social activist Advocate Jalila Haider” who led a hunger strike to stop ethnic cleansing of Hazara Shias in Baluchistan. It can be gathered from all of the examples of MN quoted in influential roles, the minorities are persevering to improve the status quo of MN – a far cry from an egalitarian society.

**Table 1c (Positions of Power in Daily *Pakistan Today*)**

| N<br>o | Newspapers                | MJ<br>Negati<br>ve<br>Roles | MJ<br>Influent<br>ial<br>Roles | MJ<br>Authori<br>tarian<br>Roles | MJ<br>Qualifi<br>ed<br>Roles | MN<br>Low<br>Status<br>Jobs-<br>Slums | MN<br>Qualifi<br>ed roles | MN<br>Authorit<br>arian<br>Roles | MN<br>Influent<br>ial<br>Roles |
|--------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 1      | Pakistan Today Dependent  | 0                           | 3                              | 2                                | 1                            | 0                                     | 0                         | 0                                | 2                              |
| 2      | Pakistan Today Editorials | 0                           | 1                              | 4                                | 1                            | 0                                     | 0                         | 0                                | 0                              |
| 3      | Pakistan Today Hard News  | 0                           | 25                             | 0                                | 2                            | 2                                     | 1                         | 3                                | 5                              |
| 4      | Pakistan Today (Op-Ed)    | 0                           | 6                              | 13                               | 0                            | 1                                     | 7                         | 8                                | 8                              |
|        | Total Indicators          | 0                           | 35                             | 19                               | 4                            | 3                                     | 8                         | 11                               | 15                             |

In authoritarian capacity, MJ occurred 19 times as compared to 11 occurrences of MN in the same role. MJ appeared as; Chief Justice Nisar, IG police, Federal Interior minister Brig (retd) Ijaz Shah and Punjab Housing Minister Mian Mehmood Rashid, Frontier Corps Inspector-General (IG) Major General Nadeem Anjum. In *Pakistan Today*, the MN’s have the most occurrences (n=19) as compared to *Dawn* (n=5), and *The Nation* (n=1) in authoritarian roles. They have been mentioned as; “Justice Alvin Robert Cornelius who had been the Chief Justice of Pakistan from May 1960 to February 1968.” In the same Op-ed it also mentions, “He was the first Christian Chief Justice of Pakistan. Justice Alvin Robert Cornelius...” Another occurrence from the same piece ‘Pakistan – A haven for minorities’ is, Justice Rana Bhagwandas who remained the acting Chief Justice of Pakistan for different intervals from 2005 to 2007. He was the first Hindu and the second non-Muslim to serve as chief of the highest court in Pakistan. Rana Bhagwandas also worked as the Chairman of Federal Public Service Commission of Pakistan.

(*Pakistan – A Haven for Minorities* | *Pakistan Today*, 2016)

All of the occurrences quoted are giving examples of the authoritarian roles in the mainstream given to MN in the past while the recent occurrences are of MN appearing in authoritarian roles to represent minorities mostly, “the minorities’ case for their rightful place in Pakistan has been ably argued by Bishop Emeritus of Lahore Dr Alexander John Malik.” Another one from hard news on ‘Forced Hindu conversions’ is, “Parliamentary Secretary for Human Rights in National Assembly Lal Chand Malhi representing the Hindu community.” An exception to the above two is the occurrence of the following:

In March, Krishna Kumari, a member of Pakistan People's Party, was elected to the 104-seat Senate, the upper house of parliament — becoming the first Hindu woman elected, albeit in a vote by parliament members and not a popular election.

*(Minorities Face Daunting Challenge in Elections / Pakistan Today, 2018)*

This may seem a positive step forward by parliament members but Krishna Kumari was not elected through an electoral system like the MJ candidates, instead, she was nominated by the senators.

The comparison of appearing in qualified roles of MJ (n= 4) as opposed to MN which has more occurrences (n=8). Surprisingly, MN occurrences have outnumbered MJ with a number of positive mentions in the op-ed piece. This implies that *Pakistan Today*, a paper known for a moderate editorial policy, acknowledges MN contributions. An editorial 'Pakistan – A haven for minorities' has a large chunk of mentions in qualified and talented roles to justify that MN are not marginalised in Pakistan. Albeit all of the mentions are of MN prominent individuals of the past and excludes anyone from the current times. The few recent mentions observed were of "FCCU Rector Dr James Tebbe, Professor Dr Farzand Masih, and Professor Dr Christy Munir."

As opposed to the appearances in qualified roles, 3 occurrences were spotted in low-status jobs or living in slums or in bondage of MN. This was not observed for MJ in any of the newspapers selected for MJ (Table 1c). An occurrence that reported a Hindu woman fleeing bondage:

Veeru Kohli was born a slave but fled bondage, walking for three days until she found offices of the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan to help her. She then returned to the landowner to recover her children and free eight other families.

*(Minorities Face Daunting Challenge in Elections / Pakistan Today, 2018)*

An incident covered in the hard news on 'Minorities face daunting challenge in elections' in the same article another instance was of:

Garbage is piled by the roadside and cinderblock homes have flimsy curtains instead of doors in Rimshah, a squatters' settlement on the outskirts of Islamabad.

This excerpt portrays the deplorable dwelling conditions of MN in the capital city of Islamabad. Another instance of MN in low status depiction was observed in an op-ed on forced conversions, "[a] Christian girl, Muskan, 14, was a domestic worker in a family of Sargodha district." Even though these are few occurrences, but they are some jarring instances faced by MN which the MJ seldom have to face in Pakistan.

To sum up the findings of the first research question, it was observed that positions of power depicted through influential, authoritarian and qualified roles were dominated by MJ in each of the newspaper. Even though MN were mentioned in the same capacities occasionally, these mentions were of MN that had occupied the positions in the past. However, only a few occurrences of MN in current seats of power were witnessed. The occurrences of MN in low-status jobs is scarcely mentioned, but the references are overwhelmingly jarring for the readers and are instrumental in indoctrinating stereotypes about minorities in the Pakistani society.

#### **4.2 Are the minorities of Pakistan represented as out-groups in the newspaper contents?**

The research question was investigated by detecting the occurrences of first person pronouns; 'we', 'us', 'our', 'me', and 'my' for both minorities and majorities. These first person pronouns are used to depict individuals belonging to the in-groups as seen from the literature reviewed. Hence, a comparison of the usage either for MJ or MN revealed if the minorities were considered as out-groups or in-groups.



Similarly, a detection of the third person plural pronoun was conducted to gauge if minorities are addressed more as out-groups as ‘they’, ‘theirs’, ‘them’ as compared to majorities in the contents written on the topic.

The comparison of both these indicators for MJ and MN showed that the in-group pronoun ‘us’, ‘we’ etc. for MJ was used 86 times as compared to only 9 times for MN in all the genres of the three newspapers. Whereas, the out-group pronouns were only used 12 times for MJ as compared to 84 times for MN as seen in Table 2.

**Table 2 (Minorities portrayed as out-groups)**

| S No | Newspaper                   | MJ ('we', 'us', 'our', 'me', 'my') | MN ('Us', 'me', 'my', 'our') | MN ('them' or 'they') | MJ ('them' or 'they') |
|------|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1    | Dawn (Herald Mag)           | 11                                 | 1                            | 8                     | 0                     |
| 2    | Dawn (Blogs)                | 16                                 | 0                            | 6                     | 2                     |
| 3    | Dawn (Editorials)           | 6                                  | 0                            | 12                    | 5                     |
| 4    | Dawn (Hard News)            | 5                                  | 1                            | 0                     | 2                     |
| 5    | Dawn (Op-ed )               | 9                                  | 3                            | 7                     | 0                     |
| 6    | Pakistan Today (Dependent)  | 4                                  | 0                            | 2                     | 0                     |
| 7    | Pakistan Today (Editorials) | 0                                  | 0                            | 0                     | 0                     |
| 8    | Pakistan Today (Hard News)  | 4                                  | 0                            | 15                    | 0                     |
| 9    | Pakistan Today (Op-Ed)      | 5                                  | 3                            | 5                     | 1                     |
| 10   | The Nation (Editorials)     | 10                                 | 0                            | 15                    | 0                     |
| 11   | The Nation (Op-ed)          | 3                                  | 0                            | 1                     | 0                     |
| 12   | The Nation (Hard News)      | 9                                  | 1                            | 13                    | 2                     |
| 13   | The Nation (Blog)           | 4                                  | 0                            | 0                     | 0                     |

|  |                  |    |   |    |    |
|--|------------------|----|---|----|----|
|  | Total Indicators | 86 | 9 | 84 | 12 |
|--|------------------|----|---|----|----|

A few of the highly characteristic examples observed in each newspaper are illustrated in an editorial in Dawn, ‘Defenseless minorities’:

Then, over the weekend as Rome’s ancient Coliseum was lit up in blood red in solidarity with persecuted Christians globally, we were reminded by the family of Aasia Bibi — condemned to death in 2010 under the blasphemy laws — that the fate of Pakistan’s minorities is often one of heartbreak. If our state seriously wishes to improve its human rights credentials...

In this excerpt, the editor is highly sympathetic towards the plight of MN, but the use of the first person pronoun “we were reminded by the family of Asia Bibi” in the sentence structure hints towards the in-group i.e. MJ as opposed to Aasia Bibi the Christian belonging to MN. Similarly, in the second sentence “our state seriously” implying the state of the majorities while talking about human rights.

In the same vein, a paragraph from an opinion piece from *Pakistan Today* divulges the extent to which the first person pronouns are used to create in-group and out-group binaries:

We, the Pakistanis are so welcoming, encouraging and caring to the minorities that we never create any hurdle in their way to join even the most sensitive institutions of Pakistan like the armed forces and the Intelligence Agencies. They are treated there on the basis of equality and performance.

(*Pakistan – A Haven for Minorities* / *Pakistan Today*, 2016)

Each of the first person pronouns; ‘we’ refers to MJ while ‘they’ the third person pronoun represent MN-out-groups of the state. To further probe if the minorities are perceived as in-groups, the scarce use (n=9) of the first person pronoun ‘us’, ‘we’, ‘our’ used for MN is indicative of not being considered as such. On the other hand, the comparison of the third person pronoun, ‘they’, ‘them’ occurs 84 times whereas the address using third person pronoun for MJ is 12 times only.

In *Pakistan Today*’s hard news an excerpt about Ahmedi’s;

Since Pakistan declared them non-Muslims in 1974, their numbers are difficult to gauge; they are believed to number several hundred thousand. Hundreds have been killed by zealots and their places of worship have been targeted; thousands more have fled Pakistan.

(*Minorities Face Daunting Challenge in Elections* / *Pakistan Today*, 2018)

The colour coded third person pronoun referrals further stamps Ahmedi’s as out-groups while the writer might not have done it intentionally.

In *The Nation*’s editorials an excerpt from many with third person pronoun referrals to MN is, “They will have protection with regard to their religion, faith, their life, their culture. They will be, in all respects, the citizens of Pakistan”( *Minorities in the Islamic Republic*, n.d.).

Another reference from the same editorial of *The Nation* references to the Ahmediyya community expresses, “They are ostracized, harassed, threatened, targeted, and their places of worship and graveyards are desecrated.” Even though the editorial is being critical of the MN’s predicament, the diction ostracizes the minority through the excessive use of the third person pronouns for MN.

After the comparison of occurrences supported with the CDA of illustrative examples, the findings of RQ2 unearth that MN are portrayed as out-groups in the three English newspapers. The first person pronouns of ‘we’, ‘us’, ‘our’, ‘my’ are used to represent MJ in comparison to the use of third person plural pronouns as ‘they’, ‘them’ or ‘their’ used for minorities. The contrast in employment of the first person pronoun for MJ, and the third person pronouns for MN either intentionally or unintentionally fosters a divide in the

minds of the readers of the English newspapers and perpetuates *otherisation* by creating in-group /out-group binaries.

**4.3. How are the images/photographs in Newspapers positioning ethnic minorities in moments of protests or violence?**

**4.4 Are the violent images against ethnic minorities inducing violent acts against them?**

In order to ordain how the images/photographs regarding MN in moments of protest or violence, two indicators were used for the purpose. Assuring for MN displayed (e.g. images portraying positive outcomes for MN to improve their status quo or if MN member were shown contributing to the society. However, images were perceived as disturbing for minorities if images that displayed violent acts being directed at them or MN were at the receiving end of demonstrations by MJ. Evidently, occurrences of the former would imply MN were presented in positive light. Even if they were not shown in the images, important events or cultural instances covered can reassure MN as in-groups (Table 3).

**Table 3 Occurrences of Images/photographs positioning MN in moments of protests or violence**

| S. No | Newspapers                  | Assuring images for MN | Disturbing Images for MN |
|-------|-----------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1     | Dawn (Herald Mag)           | 0                      | 14                       |
| 2     | Dawn (Blogs)                | 0                      | 0                        |
| 3     | Dawn (Editorials)           | 0                      | 0                        |
| 4     | Dawn (Hard News)            | 3                      | 2                        |
| 5     | Dawn (Op-ed )               | 0                      | 0                        |
| 6     | Pakistan Today (Dependent)  | 0                      | 2                        |
| 7     | Pakistan Today (Editorials) | 0                      | 0                        |
| 8     | Pakistan Today (Hard News)  | 1                      | 1                        |
| 9     | Pakistan Today (Op-ed)      | 1                      | 2                        |
| 10    | The Nation (Editorials)     | 0                      | 0                        |
| 11    | The Nation (Op-ed)          | 1                      | 2                        |
| 12    | The Nation( Hard News)      | 0                      | 2                        |
| 13    | The Nation (Blogs)          | 0                      | 0                        |
|       | Total Indicators            | 6                      | 25                       |

It is seen from Table 3 that total occurrences of assuring images for MN in all the genres of the three newspapers is 6 as compared to 25 photographs displaying disturbing portrayals of MN in moments of protests and violence.

Examples of illustrating pictures of assurance are seen in Dawn Hard news:



**Image A-Minorities after gaining voting rights (Dawn news)**

Image A was taken from an article covering voting rights. MN were given the right to vote for reserved as well as general seats after the amendment to Punjab Local Government Act in 2019. Image A is positive and reassuring of minority positions in Pakistani society. It is a step towards minorities officially being considered as in-groups possessing equal voting rights to MJ citizens of Pakistan.

Another image of a place of worship of Sikhs was taken when military officers of 45 countries visited a Gurdwara (temple) Panja Sahab shown in Image B.

Image B- Gurdwara (PanjaSahab)



Image B is a positively encouraging photograph of MN showing hundreds of Sikh pilgrims peacefully paying homage to their place of worship in Hassanabdal –a city in north Punjab.

In contradiction, disturbing images were witnessed many more times especially in *Dawn's* magazine, *The Herald*. Illustrative examples of this are shown in Images C-F.

Image C



Image D



In Image C- an angry mob (MJ) is depicted setting fire to a Christian home in Joseph colony in Lahore. Image D also shows anti-blasphemy protesters hurling stones. Each of the images are overwhelmingly disturbing for MN, as they depict horrendous actions that the MJ can undertake in the pretext of

blasphemy. Some more horrific images are shown in Image D and E. Image D shows a Christian home burnt down during the attack by MJ protesters against anti-blasphemy. Image E displays a Christian girl Rimsha- accused of blasphemy being guided to safety.



**Image D- A Christian home burnt during the bombing attack in Lahore.**



**Image E - Rimsha, a Christian girl in Islamabad being escorted to safety**

Another jarring image- Image F witnessed in Dawn hard News is of a Hindu man beaten mercilessly by the police shown in custody for selling eatables in the month of Ramadan (month of fasting for MJ).

**Image F – Hindu man beaten by a superintendent of police who is seen behind bars**



Therefore, the findings of RQ 2 reveal that more disturbing images appear and MN are positioned at the receiving end of MJ's discriminatory acts i.e. 25 versus only 6 of assuring images. They incite further violence against the minorities. Viewing images of acts of violence makes readers attuned to vehemence and tends to cultivate stereotypes and perpetuate abominable actions against out-groups (Koopmans & Olzak, 2004).

**4.5 Are the actions taken against the minorities represented by nominalisation, passivisation, and through metonymy in the newspaper contents and headlines?**

Table 4 shows that metonymy in the contents of the three papers occurred 60 times while nominalisation and passivisation of headlines occurred 18 times. It is defined as the “trope in which one word, phrase or object is substituted for another from a semantically related field of reference” (Richardson, 2007, p. 64). For example, the cause or creator is replaced by the product; user of the object by an object; people replaced by a place; events replaced by the date; country or state, replaced by (certain) their citizens” (Richardson, 2007, p. 65). Moreover, it is seen from Table 4 that ‘nominalisation and passivisation of headlines’ occurred 18 times while within the contents of the three papers it was noted 30 times. However, news headlines phrased in active voice about MJ or MN have occurred at 12 instances each.

**Table 4 – Nominalisation, passivisation and metonymy.**

| S. N O | Newspaper                   | Metonymy | News Headline (active voice for MJ) | News Headlines (active voice for MN) | Nominalisation & Passivisation (Headlines) | Nominalisation & Passivisation for MN |
|--------|-----------------------------|----------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|
| 1      | Dawn ( Herald Mag)          | 13       | 0                                   | 0                                    | 1  | 12                                    |
| 2      | Dawn (Blogs)                | 0        | 0                                   | 0                                    | 0  | 0                                     |
| 3      | Dawn (Editorials)           | 11       | 0                                   | 2                                    | 3  | 2                                     |
| 4      | Dawn (Hard News)            | 11       | 1                                   | 1                                    | 3  | 0                                     |
| 5      | Dawn (Op-ed )               | 5        | 0                                   | 0                                    | 2  | 0                                     |
| 6      | Pakistan Today (Dependent)  | 3        | 0                                   | 1                                    | 0  | 1                                     |
| 7      | Pakistan Today (Editorials) | 8        | 2                                   | 1                                    | 1  | 0                                     |
| 8      | Pakistan Today (Hard News)  | 1        | 1                                   | 1                                    | 2  | 2                                     |
| 9      | Pakistan Today (Op-Ed)      | 2        | 2                                   | 1                                    | 3  | 0                                     |
| 10     | The Nation (Editorials)     | 10       | 0                                   | 0                                    | 0  | 13                                    |
| 11     | The Nation (Op-ed)          | 1        | 1                                   | 2                                    | 0  | 0                                     |
| 12     | The Nation( Hard News)      | 0        | 5                                   | 3                                    | 3  | 0                                     |

|        |                     |    |    |    |    |    |
|--------|---------------------|----|----|----|----|----|
| 1<br>3 | The<br>Nation(Blog) | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  | 0  |
|        | Total Indicators    | 60 | 12 | 12 | 18 | 30 |

In a *Dawn* editorial, ‘Aasia’s departure’ talking about her acquittal from the blasphemy case filed against her, a phrase used:

Aasia Bibi — in protective custody at an unknown location since being acquitted of blasphemy by the Supreme Court last year — has left Pakistan for Canada.

The colour coded portion displays metonymy being deliberately employed the name of a place – Supreme Court is used to safeguard the identity of the Chief Justice to avoid any life threatening consequences as faced by Salman Taseer. Similarly, in another instance in *Dawn Hard News*, CSJ has prepared recommendations ... the Constitution and interpreted in the June 19, 2014, judgment of the Supreme Court, which directs for the rights of minorities to be protected.”

The colour coded portions in the quote are illustrations of metonymy. In the first instance, CSJ – the congregation of St Joeseph’s and Mary replaces the names of people proposing the recommendations. The second occurrence, the Supreme Court – the place replaces the Chief Justice’s name.

In *The Dependent – Pakistan Today’s* magazine, an illustration of metonymy out of the 3 observed is of a state replacing the agent in:

“Pakistan also persecuted religious minorities and used jihadist groups as strategic assets in the region in 1992.” It’s a quintessential depiction.

Three indicators were created to compare the use of active voice for MN and MJ in news headlines along with the employment of nominalisation and passivisation in headlines for MN. It is seen occurrences of active voice phrasing news headlines either in favour of MJ or empathetic towards MN appear the same (n=12) number of times. Though news headlines using active voice for MN is equal to MJ, most of the headlines convey some issue plaguing minorities and few of the headlines convey some positive news involving MN. Mostly, they were pointing at MNs issues like; “Plight of minorities”; “Minorities face daunting challenge in upcoming elections”; “Defenceless Minorities”. Few of the headlines conveyed some positive news like; “Remembering an outstanding son of the soil” (commending Raja Ranjit Singh-Sikh ruler of Lahore after Mughals)

Another positive active voice headline, “Minority students get scholarships” a hard news of *The Nation* seem to portray MN in positive light, but it hails the Chief Minister (MJ) who distributed the scholarships, in fact, it’s a positive portrayal of the government.

Nominalisation and passivisation are purposefully employed by removing the agents from the actions taken against minorities through nominalisation or using the passive voice to phrase headlines that point towards injustices against MN – the indicator has occurred 18 times.

Illustrative examples from Dawn editorials are “Blaming minorities” – a headline of an article which talks about a biased decision taken by a judge against an establishment owned by an Ahmedi (MN). In order to avoid contention, the agent who blamed MN is missing from the phrase. Another headline using passivisation is from *Dawn* hard news a “Religious minorities facing issues today not highlighted by media” . It is another characteristic passive headline construction phrased to avoid holding the media accountable if it was constructed in active voice.

A headline using nominalisation from the magazine *The Dependent (Pakistan Today)*, “Another blot on govt’s claims of meritocracy as nation’s worst kafirs declared without due process” talks about the ruling of Ahmedis being declared the worst kafirs (infidels), however, who declared it is missing.

From *The Nation's* hard news a headline occurred, “Forced conversion of minors” the agent who forced the conversions is non-existent to avoid blaming an influential MJ.

The fourth indicator employed to substantiate that newspaper contents employ nominalisation and passivisation to dissipate the deplorable actions against MN or to avoid blaming MJ for such actions was the detection of both these processes in the syntax of sentences of the three newspapers. The indicator occurred 30 times. Some quintessential illustrations are elaborated in an editorial in *Dawn*:

“As is the wont in Pakistan, no action followed for four years, and business continued as usual in the context of minorities’ issues.” The colour coded portion shows a verb is converted into a noun phrase, another instance recorded from the same paper is,

“Law Minister Rana Sanaullah said that Pakhtuns had every right to live in Punjab and that allegations of their victimisation were attempts to spread hatred.”

Again the colour coded portion is a conversion of verbs to a noun phrase deliberately employed by the speaker to denounce and rebuff the allegations by removing the agent – an influential MJ in order to respond tactfully. Similarly, in an occurrence in *The Herald*;

According to the Centre for Social Justice, a Lahore-based research and advocacy group, at least 62 men and women have been killed on mere suspicion of blasphemy between 1987 and 2015. So far, no one has been executed by the state.

In the last italicized bold portion where passivisation is employed to avoid naming MJ, so that legal repercussions are circumvented.

In *Pakistan Today* hard news, a typical example observed, “abduction and forced conversion” each of the verbs have been converted into nouns regarding Hindu underage girls getting abducted by MJ actors, which are not mentioned, and forcefully converted to Islam displaying nominalisation.

In an editorial in *The Nation*, an illustrative occurrence seen, “Constitution of Pakistan is laden with contradictions that provide cause to the government to choose or ignore its obligations.” The italicized bold portion is again a conversion of the verb ‘contradict’ into a noun phrase as it is talking about a prestigious document and blaming it could cause legal consequences.

Hence, the findings of the four indicators to answer RQ 4 reveal that all the newspapers resort to nominalisation and passivisation with metonymy taking the lead with 60 occurrences followed by the former with 30 occurrences to circumvent and dissipate any life threatening or legal ramifications.

#### 4.6 What type of language i.e. positive/negative used to discuss ethnic religious minorities in Pakistan?

**Table 6 –Positive/negative use of language to discuss minorities**

| Sl No | Newspaper         | Negative connotations for MN | Positive words (MN) | Negative Connotation for MJ | Negative words for MJ | Negative Words for MN | Positive connotations for MN | Positive connotation for MJ | Positive words for MJ |
|-------|-------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1     | Dawn (Herald Mag) | 0                            | 2                   | 11                          | 8                     | 12                    | 0                            | 5                           | 5                     |
| 2     | Dawn (Blogs)      | 0                            | 1                   | 1                           | 1                     | 0                     | 0                            | 6                           | 0                     |



|    |                             |                              |          |                             |                       |                       |                      |                      |                       |
|----|-----------------------------|------------------------------|----------|-----------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
| 3  | Dawn (Editorials)           | 2                            | 1        | 6                           | 18                    | 7                     | 0                    | 12                   | 0                     |
| 4  | Dawn (Hard News)            | 7                            | 0        | 2                           | 12                    | 4                     | 0                    | 22                   | 1                     |
| 5  | Dawn (Op-ed)                | 0                            | 6        | 0                           | 10                    | 0                     | 0                    | 1                    | 0                     |
| 6  | Pakistan Today (Dependent)  | 11                           | 0        | 0                           | 2                     | 3                     | 0                    | 0                    | 0                     |
| 7  | Pakistan Today (Editorials) | 0                            | 8        | 20                          | 2                     | 0                     | 0                    | 30                   | 0                     |
| 8  | Pakistan Today (Hard News)  | 5                            | 2        | 0                           | 5                     | 9                     | 0                    | 1                    | 0                     |
| 9  | Pakistan Today (Op-Ed)      | 3                            | 5        | 10                          | 6                     | 2                     | 0                    | 32                   | 0                     |
| 10 | The Nation (Editorials)     | 0                            | 0        | 0                           | 22                    | 5                     | 0                    | 0                    | 3                     |
| 11 | The Nation (Op-ed)          | 2                            | 0        | 20                          | 9                     | 0                     | 3                    | 16                   | 1                     |
| 12 | The Nation (Hard News)      | 13                           | 8        | 3                           | 5                     | 3                     | 0                    | 20                   | 0                     |
| 13 | The Nation (Blog)           | 0                            | 0        | 0                           | 0                     | 0                     | 0                    | 11                   | 1                     |
| 14 | Total Indicators            | 43                           | 33       | 73                          | 100                   | 45                    | 3                    | 156                  | 11                    |
|    |                             | Negative connotations for MN | Positive | Negative Connotation for MJ | Negative words for MJ | Negative Words for MN | Positive connotation | Positive connotation | Positive words for MJ |

|  |  |  |               |  |  |  |           |     |          |     |  |
|--|--|--|---------------|--|--|--|-----------|-----|----------|-----|--|
|  |  |  | words<br>(MN) |  |  |  | ons<br>MN | for | on<br>MJ | for |  |
|--|--|--|---------------|--|--|--|-----------|-----|----------|-----|--|

A comparison of eight indicators depicted positive/negative words and their positive and negative connotations used to discuss either MJ or MN seen in Table 5. MN were generally mentioned with positive words more than MJ. MN were directly discussed positively 33 times as compared to 11 times about MJ. This may appear surprising but majority of the positive mentions of MN were of individuals from history or of non-Pakistani individuals while very few positive mentions were of present MN or were Pakistani. In *Dawn's* Editorial talking about the Kartarpur corridor, Sikh's were praised,

Bhagat Singh who was hanged at the tender age of 23 wore the turban given by his religion but took it off without offending his community when he needed to disguise himself from his British pursuers to fight for India's independence.

Other examples are, "[Jagmeet] Singh could become deputy prime minister in Justin Trudeau's minority government". Or of "Guru [Nanak] denounced the caste system." Some other names from history; "Maharaja Ranjit Singh is known for putting an end to the lawlessness."

A few occurrences were seen in the Op-ed piece of *Pakistan Today* 'Pakistan – A haven for minorities' as "Group Captain Cecil Chaudhry was a fighter pilot of Pakistan Air Force who bravely fought against India in the wars of 1965 and 1971,"

These are positive words for Air force officer, but of achievements 50 years ago. More importantly, the mention is in context to the portrayal of Pakistan – a safe place to live for minorities thus indirectly a positive connotation for MJ.

A large difference is observed between the positive connotative mentions of MJ (n=156) as compared to MN mentioned for the same reason 3 times only. Though a comparison of negative connotations between MN (n=43) and MJ (n=73) reveals less number of occurrences of negative connotative words for MN by being critical of MJ, however, no specific names were mentioned of MJ's. Apart from the mention of the name of the perpetrator of forced conversion of a minor Christian girl, most of the negative connotative words used employed metonymy or nominalisation or passivisation to avoid consequences.

In *Dawn's* editorial an occurrence states, "[g]iven the province's chequered history with regard to extremism and violence against minorities" mentions the entire province – a place thus employing metonymy. Another example displaying nominalisation is "the space for minorities was shrinking in Pakistan", but the agent who is shrinking the space for MN is missing.

Another occurrence in *Pakistan Today* about Asia Bibi's acquittal's statement depicts the negative connotations implied through rhetorical questions and not directly targeted at MJ; "Aasia Bibi is a free person. But is she? ... Can she leave Pakistan if provided asylum by a foreign country?"

On the other hand, negative connotative words are more directly targeted towards MN as seen in an occurrence in *Dawn Hard News* "in the wake of the recent alleged kidnappings of Reena and Raveena, and another girl Shania," the sentence has a negative connotation as the news is titled 'Controversy about Hindu sisters' also, the word alleged in the syntax insinuates element of doubt.

In *Pakistan Today's* magazine *The Dependent*, "the nation's 'worst kafirs' were declared" regarding an article about Ahmedi's being declared as the worst kafirs (non-believers) - a highly negative connotative phrase.

As seen for negative connotative words for MJ, similarly, direct negative words targeted at MJ (n=100) appear much more than against MN (n=45), but no specific names are mentioned, instead, the use of

collective nouns like “Sunni extremists who promise to rid Pakistan of Shiite Muslims” or “Frenzied mobs have killed at the mere suggestion that an act of blasphemy was committed” (*Pakistan Today*).

In a Dawn op-ed, “Mullahs [clerics] are hardly ever prosecuted for provoking mobs, and non-Muslim villagers live in fear.”

In *The Nation* similar collective nouns are used to reprove MJ “[c]ases under blasphemy law have also been registered against Muslims who have harassed non-Muslims.”

Only once specific names of perpetrators of forced conversion of Hindu girls were mentioned of MJ both in *Dawn* and *The Nation*’s hard news “Mian Mithu Bharchoondi and Pir Ayub Jan Sirhindi for their alleged role in supporting such inhuman practice.” Even though specific names of MJ perpetrators have been mentioned but the word alleged creates an element of doubt in the minds of the readers.

Hence, the findings of RQ 6 reveals that though quantitative occurrences of negative connotative and negative words are more against MJ than MN, the use of metonymy, nominalisation, passivisation and collective nouns reduces the impact of such news coverage. Conversely, the positive connotative words used for MJ are mentioned with specific names to exploit and to appear empathetic towards MN. These specific names appear to gain popularity of the readers through the positive measures undertaken by the MJ political authorities.

#### 4.7 Are the minorities mentioned mostly to highlight issues (perceived as problematic) or to contribute to the society?

Four indicators were formulated to reveal if minorities were perceived as useful members of the society. The comparison of MN’s portrayal as contributors to the society, as problematic, and mentioned to highlight issues determined ethnic and religious minorities’ portrayals. A comparison of occurrences between MJ mentioned to highlight issues to MN mentioned in the same capacity unearths MJ were mentioned 77 times while MN were mentioned 324 times (Table 6). To further clarify if minorities are mostly perceived as problematic, a comparison between MN contributing to society (n=52), the cultural events presented of MN (n=16) and MN used to highlight issues (n=324) was made.

**Table 7 Minorities mentioned to highlight issues or to contribute to society**

| No | Newspaper                   | Cultural Events mentioned of MN | MJ ( highlight issues) | MN ( highlight issues) | MN (Contribute to society) |
|----|-----------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1  | Dawn (Herald Mag)           | 0                               | 15                     | 48                     | 1                          |
| 2  | Dawn (Blogs)                | 0                               | 5                      | 7                      | 0                          |
| 3  | Dawn (Editorials)           | 1                               | 7                      | 56                     | 0                          |
| 4  | Dawn (Hard News)            | 0                               | 9                      | 31                     | 8                          |
| 5  | Dawn (Op-ed )               | 0                               | 4                      | 19                     | 8                          |
| 6  | Pakistan Today (Dependent)  | 0                               | 7                      | 5                      | 0                          |
| 7  | Pakistan Today (Editorials) | 0                               | 1                      | 5                      | 3                          |
| 8  | Pakistan Today (Hard News)  | 2                               | 0                      | 26                     | 13                         |

|    |                         |    |    |     |    |
|----|-------------------------|----|----|-----|----|
| 9  | Pakistan Today (Op-Ed)  | 4  | 1  | 32  | 4  |
| 10 | The Nation (Editorials) | 0  | 25 | 60  | 1  |
| 11 | The Nation (Op-ed)      | 0  | 3  | 23  | 2  |
| 12 | The Nation (Hard News)  | 9  | 0  | 12  | 12 |
| 13 | The Nation (Blog)       | 0  | 0  | 0   | 0  |
|    | Total Indicators        | 16 | 77 | 324 | 52 |

Predominantly, MN have been mentioned to highlight issues in all of the newspapers of all the genres of news coverage. Some quintessential illustrative examples from each paper are:

From *Dawn* editorial,

“Six months later, minister for minorities Shahbaz Bhatti who, like Taseer, had expressed support for Aasia Bibi and demanded changes to the blasphemy law to prevent its abuse, was also gunned down.”

From *Dawn* hard news, “Hindu community also staged a protest at a main highway linking Daharki, Sindh.” This was a protest against forced underage Hindu girls’ conversion. Another occurrence talks about, “According to a study carried out by the University of Birmingham, at least 2,866 cases of conversion involving women and girls were reported between January 2012 and June 2017 in Pakistan.”

In a *Dawn* op-ed, “Yusuf Masih had to leave town so that the other Christian families, who had fled when their homes were attacked, could return.”

In *Pakistan Today* an occurrence expresses,

Aasia Bibi, the Christian woman who fled the country after having her blasphemy death sentence overturned by the Supreme Court, got into trouble with her Muslim neighbours because of a common drinking vessel.

(*The State of the Minorities | Pakistan Today, 2020*)

Even if certain positive steps were taken, they highlight an issue, The Islamabad High Court (IHC) on Friday issued a notice to the Establishment Division over a petition against the federal government for not reserving a 5% job quota for religious minorities.

(*Petition Filed in IHC against Violation of Minorities Job Quota | Pakistan Today, 2019*)

In contrast, MN mentioned to contribute to society illustrations are mostly of individuals who either fought for freedom for the creation of Pakistan or from history like Maharaja Ranjit Singh or Guru Nanak. Few recent examples are,

Asif Munawar is a Christian living in Jhang District in Punjab. He is also an award-winning citizen; he won the Right to Information Champion Award organised by the Centre for Peace and Development Initiative (CPDI) for his constructive use of the Right to Information Act to develop awareness among his community.

(*LAW: THE RIGHT TO KNOW - Newspaper - DAWN.COM, 2019*)

Or in *The Herald*, “It is worth remembering here, that the country’s only Nobel laureate, Dr Abdus Salam, and its first foreign minister, Sir Zafarullah Khan, were Ahmadis.” A mention to discuss later the innumerable atrocities faced by minorities of Pakistan currently.

In Pakistan Today, the mention of, “Bishop of Lahore Irfan Jamil said the Christian community was playing significant role in fields of education, medicine, social work and even in the armed forces”(Forced Conversions Un-Islamic, Says PM on Minority Day / Pakistan Today, 2019). This coverage in the papers hard news lacked any specific names, and it was followed by the demand of the Bishop for increasing the job quota for minorities thus falling under highlighting issues.

Regarding the coverage of cultural events of MN, only 16 occurrences were detected. In Dawn’s editorial the mention of Sikh pilgrimage to Nankana Sahab (temple) situated in North of Punjab is mentioned, Supreme Court’s decision to constitute a special bench to protect minority rights in light of a 2014 landmark verdict; and the opening of the Kartarpur Corridor for Sikh pilgrims — have led to some much-needed course correction.

(Religious Inclusion - Newspaper - DAWN.COM, 2019)

Or in Pakistan Today (Hard News),

In a message on the occasion of Christmas, the prime minister extended his heartiest felicitations and wished Merry Christmas to the Christian brethren in Pakistan and all over the world.

(Govt Committed to Minorities Empowerment: PM / Pakistan Today, 2019)

In The Nation (Hard news),

PPP chairman said, “I felicitate the Christians on the occasion of their highly esteemed rituals of the Easter from the core of my heart.

(Bilawal Felicitates Christians, 2019)

Each of the above stated examples are acknowledging MN’s cultural and religious occasions, but the political leaders belonging to MJ are using it for their own political agenda by gaining popularity.

Thus the findings of RQ 7 reveal that newspaper coverage of MN is predominantly to highlight issues instead of ethnic minorities’ portrayal as contributors to society or as mainstream citizens celebrating their cultural events. Such a prodigiously imbalanced depiction of minorities leads the readers to perceive MN as problematic especially by the MJ readers.

The discussion and critical evaluation of the findings will be extrapolated in the next chapter.

## 5. Discussion

This chapter discusses and adds to the comprehension of critical discourse analysis of newspapers conducted in the Pakistani context. The discussion of results pertaining to each respective research question points towards the marginalisation of religious and ethnic minorities of Pakistan committed by the sample of English newspapers. This section compares the findings critically in relation to the research questions and compares them with reference to the previous literature reviewed.

### 5.1 Discussion on findings of RQ1

The findings of the first research question established that MN are seldom portrayed in elite roles or in positions of power across all the selected newspapers. In the few instances where minorities are portrayed in authoritarian or influential or qualified roles, they were individuals in the past while very few occurrences were seen of MN occupying these positions currently. Moreover, MN were portrayed in low-status menial jobs ten times in the daily Dawn, once in The Nation and three times in Pakistan Today. However, MJ were not once portrayed in low occupations as sweepers, janitors or bonded labour. Such portrayals foster stereotypes in the minds of the readers witnessed from the lack of occurrence of MJ in these roles. The findings were in concurrence to the findings of Lubbers & Scheepers (2010), and also

confirm *Gerbner's cultivation theory*. The results of the first research question also conformed to the findings of Liu (2004) study which concluded after the corpus analysis of 857 articles that Chinese immigrants were stereotypically portrayed as illegal immigrants mostly involved in illicit activities.

## 5.2 Discussion on findings of RQ 2

The results of the second research question established that MN were intentionally or unintentionally considered as out-groups through the creation of 'us' versus 'them' binaries while the second person pronouns were mostly employed for ethnic and religious minorities of Pakistan. The comparison of occurrence of the first person and the third person pronouns for MJ and MN showed that the in-group pronoun such as 'us', and 'we' for MJ was used 86 times compared to a mere 9 times for MN in all the genres of the three newspapers. While the out-group pronouns were only used 12 times for MJ as compared to 84 times for MN as seen in Table 2. The stark difference between the occurrences perpetuates polarisation of the in-group versus out-group and creates the dominant groups' hegemony. Even though the content writers of the three newspapers were sympathetic towards the plight of MN, their phrasing ousted the minorities thus manifesting ethnocentrism explained by Billiet et al., (1996); Pieterse et al., (1993); Scheepers et al., (1997); Smooha, (1987); Van Dijk, (1993). Apart from a couple of articles written by the minorities, it was observed that MN seldom authored news covering their issues – propagation of another form of marginalisation observed.

The findings of RQ 2 were also confirmed by the findings of the research question 6 as MN were predominantly covered to highlight issues instead of contributing to the society. Ethnic and religious minorities were perpetuated and portrayed as problematic and hindering peace and harmony of the society. These findings hint at the 'realistic conflict theory' coined by Levine & Campbell (1972) and studied by Lubbers & Scheepers (2010); Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart (2009). According to the theory, MN are perceived as a threat to the sustenance of the lower income MJ classes. If MN are predominantly shown protesting or even if MN are portrayed as targets, it disrupts the normal routine of society in general.

## 5.3 Discussion on RQ 3 and 4

The images published about MN in the three newspapers for the third research question, revealed more disturbing images (n=25) of and for the religious and ethnic minorities of Pakistan in comparison to assuring ones (n=6). Disturbing images displayed minorities positioned at the receiving end in times of protest. If protests were by the majority, it was against the MN. Some extremely shuddering images of torture of Hindu minorities were also found in the sample. Although few assuring images were detected showing MN gaining voting rights or of their places of worship, they were not as frequent or impactful. Since images of violence provoke further heinous acts against minorities as seen in the study conducted by Koopmans and Olzak (2004), prevalence of these images may make the majorities accustomed to such discriminatory acts of violence against MN. Thus, answering RQ4 that violence is propagated through frequently viewing disturbing images. It might make the influential echelons of society to become indifferent to these images and can lead to a lack of initiative on their part to improve the status quo of minorities of Pakistan. This indifference results from the cultivation of stereotypical treatments of out-groups, which are already prevalent in society and further propagated if shown as such, thus it proves to be counterproductive. Hence, portrayals of inclusion of MN in the society as in-groups might aid to improve the circumstances and foster the formation of a virtuous cycle between newspapers and the societal norms.

#### 5.4 Discussion on RQ 5

The grammatical functions of nominalisation and passivisation coined by Fairclough (2003) and Fowler (1991) were ubiquitously employed (n=30) not only within the articles but in the phrasing of the headlines by the content writers of the three English newspapers. Similarly, the grammatical device of metonymy defined by Richardson (2004, 2007) was detected 60 times in the corpus.

The findings of RQ 5 support the results of previous studies conducted on the use of rhetorical devices such as 'metonymy' to construct and perpetuate ideologies as found in studies by Fartousi and Dumanig (2012); Bonyadi and Samuel (2013), and Farrokhi and Nazemi (2015). All of the studies revealed the use of rhetorical devices for constructing perspectives and persuading their readers in newspapers. Employment of nominalisation and passivisation was discovered both in headlines and in the corpus to imply agency instead of directly articulating it to avoid any legal or life-threatening ramifications by the publication houses. These findings were also confirmed by Sajjad (2013) who discovered passivisation as the most employed and most easily detected rhetorical device in phrasing headlines (n=20). The use of these devices work against the minorities of Pakistan as the influential MJ perpetrators are not held accountable for their vile acts.

#### 5.5 Discussion on RQ 6

Though quantitative occurrences of negatively connotative and negative words were more often used in conjunction with MJ than MN, the use of metonymy, nominalisation, passivisation, and collective nouns diminish the impact of such news coverage as established through the results of RQ 6. On the contrary, the positive connotative words and positive words used for MJ were more directly mentioned with specific names to show empathetic attitude of MJ towards the quandary of minorities. If positive measures were adopted by authorities, they were not implied instead phrased in active voice and highlighted to gain political popularity. Contrasting use of phrasing for MJ and MN subtly influences the perception of the readers and perpetuates ethnocentrism as seen in Vergeer et al. (1996); Lubbers & Scheepers (2010); Hassan (2018) and Oliver (1999).

#### 5.6 Discussion on RQ 7

In order to establish if minorities are perceived as problematic revealed through the comparison between the indicators mentioned to highlight issues or to contribute to the society for RQ 7. A comparison of occurrences between MJ mentioned to highlight issues to MN cited in the same capacity revealed MJ occurred 77 times while MN were mentioned 324 times. Also to discover if newspapers portray and perceive MN as problematic, a comparison between MN contributing to society (n=52), and the cultural events presented of MN (n=16) in the news contents, and MN used to highlight issues (n=324) was made. Undoubtedly, the results of RQ7 suggest that the three English newspapers of Pakistan; *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan Today* predominantly highlight issues faced by ethnic and religious minorities, but they shape the perception of the readers through their portrayals. While minorities are largely mentioned to highlight issues through op-eds and editorials to incite sympathy, hard news coverage usually use nominalisation and passivisation in their headlines and corpus. This tends to misrepresent the minorities. Hence, the coverage raises mixed emotions amongst readers-emotions of angst and even animosity.

Minorities are perceived creating social imbalances in the society through protests and incidents covered of MN. In the same vein, Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart (2009) also discovered that perception about immigrants either positive or negative was shaped through the type of portrayals. Similarly, MN were

predominantly covered to highlight issues and less frequently contributing to the society. Consequently, MN were more negatively portrayed than positively. Positive portrayals were indicated by contributions to the society or through peaceful celebrations of their cultural events. Since the occurrences are largely covered to highlight issues, the ethnic and religious minorities will be perceived as problematic and negatively by the majorities of Pakistan.

### 5.7 Chapter Summary

Through the critical discourse analysis and count of frequency of occurrences of each indicator, it can be deduced that the corpus of the three English newspapers: *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan* is guilty of misrepresentation and marginalisation of MN of Pakistan. For some indicators, it was perpetuated subtly while for others more blatantly. Rhetorical devices and grammatical functions such as nominalisation, and passivisation or metonymy led to subtle perpetuation as opposed to the more blatant use of ‘us’ versus ‘them’ polarization. Images of protests and violence were also a more direct propagation of marginalisation. The few occurrences of MN in influential or authoritarian or qualified roles as compared to MJ in the same capacity manifested stereotypical representations of positions of power occupied mostly by MJ. On the other hand, the non-existent appearance of MJ in low status jobs while MN were mostly mentioned occupying menial janitorial jobs as sweepers or cleaners further cultivated negative societal norms.

### 6. Conclusion

The chapter begins with a summary of the entire dissertation. It is followed by recommendations for improvement in the publication policies of newspapers to be implemented to avoid the marginalisation and misrepresentation of MN. Secondly, some pedagogical implications are discussed, and finally avenues of future research are suggested.

The study investigated ethnic and religious minority’s representation in three English daily newspapers of Pakistan; *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan Today* over the past three years. It explored through critical discourse analysis and quantitative detection of occurrences of indicators eclectically selected from different studies that were applicable in the current context. Even though the three newspapers’ editorial policies appear empathetic towards the minorities of Pakistan as direct negative words were seldom employed, but they incorporated rhetorical devices such as nominalisation, passivisation and metonymy instrumental in misrepresentation and marginalisation of ethnic and religious minorities. Misrepresentation was perpetuated further through the creation of polarization manifested by the use of *us* versus *them* pronouns and the stereotypical construction of in-group versus out-group binaries (Van Dijk, 2015).

The findings point towards an inherent limitation of the three publication houses of protecting themselves from legal and life threatening ramifications, and reflects the status quo of the ethnic and religious minorities in Pakistani society. The current circumstances necessitate, the regulatory bodies of electronic and print media-Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) and the Press Council of Pakistan (PCP) to scrutinise content and encourage more pro-ethnic and secular policies of writing. These regulatory bodies need to develop writing skills training wings and conduct mandatory writing workshops for the current journalist or media writers to get certified for possessing ethnic and religious awareness before they can publish any content in the newspapers. Such implications of the research are discussed in this final chapter



### 6.1 Recommendations for Improvement of publication policies:

In this study, three English newspaper publication houses: *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan Today*, which possess diverse editorial policies were selected. Each newspaper irrespective of their editorial inclination revealed occurrences of indicators perpetuating the marginalisation of minorities. To combat this issue, it is imperative to inform and hone the writing skills of the current journalists, columnists, and editors of these newspapers. Some of the recommendations for including in writing skills workshops and making explicit efforts to build awareness of the following:

1. Avoid creating *us* versus *them* polarisation while writing. A more inclusive writing policy should be implemented. Using specific names of people involved regardless of their religious inclinations would help in eradicating polarisation.
2. Increase news coverage of MN currently occupying positions of power: influential roles, authoritarian roles, and qualified roles. The writers/readers should be made accustomed to seeing MN in positions of power. This will help in creation and proliferation of norms that positions of power are awarded purely on merit to deserving candidates irrespective of their ethnicity and religion.
3. Avoid the use of nominalisation or passivisation or metonymy for framing news headlines and corpus about news involving MJ perpetrators. Instead, media writers should use active voice and incorporate agencies to construct headlines or contents of the articles. Naming the perpetrators would act as a deterrent for other MJ influential perpetrators and curb the atrocities faced by minorities or out-groups.
4. Incorporate active voice for identifying specific MJ offenders. This would be a direct and clear allegation against MJ offenders and would protect both MN and MJ in the process. Journalists and the publication houses would refrain from spreading fake news to create sensationalism involving MJ and MN.
5. Include more assuring images for MN. Images of minorities taking part in mainstream societal activities such as philanthropic efforts, and more images of MN's cultural events should be included.
6. Increase constructions with positive connotations for MN. Incorporating diction and phrases that directly or indirectly mention MN in a positive light will help break stereotypes of *otherisation*.
7. More coverage of MN contributing to society shatters the perception of MN being problematic members. Portrayal of MN as useful members of the society in qualified roles including details of their current academic and professional endeavours would curtail the creation of binaries and hegemonic discourse.
8. Increase reporting of MN's cultural events such as Christmas and Easter for Christians, Holi and Diwali for Hindus, and Baisakhi for Sikhs could change the perception of majorities. MJ may start viewing MN as less outlandish, instead, as an integral part of the Pakistani society.

### 6.2 Pedagogical implications of the study:

The topic for the study is a multidisciplinary one (Fairclough, 2004) involving critical discourse analysis, linguistics, academic writing, media writing, psychology, sociology, rhetoric and religious literacies. Hence, the pedagogical implications could be construed for each of these disciplines mentioned. Instructors teaching courses related to language in the media at the tertiary level in Pakistan should make concerted efforts to impart knowledge about the subtle perpetuation and construction of stereotypical in-group and out-group binaries by newspapers.

Course content especially in media writing courses, and in academic writing pertaining to the aforementioned courses should include materials that highlight polarisation created by newspapers

through the use of the first and third person pronouns. Sensitising students to the social repercussions of their usage and inviting them to critically evaluate pieces of texts displaying hegemonic construction of majorities and of *otherisation* in the Pakistani societal structure could be used as a teaching strategy. Course instructors should instill critical thinking skills to achieve the final product or texts reflecting which reflect a more balanced and egalitarian stance. Course outlines should entail reading and writing exercises that make the students practice politically correct writing. Moreover, informing students of the prevalence of subtle if not blatant ethnocentrism, racism in interracial and interethnic discourse under the guise of neoliberalism could curb the reproduction of texts displaying marginalisation and misrepresentation of minorities (Fairclough, 2004; Fowler, 1991; Qazi & Shah, 2018; Shafer, 2017; Skerrett, 2014).

### 6.3 Limitations:

The main limitation foreseen was the selection of English newspapers instead of Urdu which is the language of discourse in Pakistan. However, English newspapers were selected as they are known for being more credible sources of information than Urdu newspapers thus a relatively accurate depiction of minorities can be expected. Also, the selected English papers like *Dawn* and even *The Nation* have international readership thus making them more impactful samples of print media as compared to the national language. The status of English as an International Language and as a global language cannot be denied. English has gained prominence as a Lingua Franca (Seidlhofer, 2004). Hence, the selection of English newspapers for a critical discourse analysis to detect marginalisation of minorities in Pakistan unearthed findings that will prove to be a significant addition to the global academic arena.

According to Shah (2010), only 11 percent of the population of Pakistan can read English newspapers, thus the remaining populace would remain unaffected by the contents of these English newspapers. However, English newspaper readership would have increased in the past ten years after the publication of Shah's (2010) research, especially after the introduction of e-newspapers with the dawn of internet. More importantly, the readership percentage consists of mostly readers belonging to upper echelons of society— Influential elite readers that have the resources to take steps for improving the status quo of impoverished minorities of Pakistan. Hence, English newspapers are also termed as the “elite oriented press” (Shah, 2010). Nevertheless, it has been observed that newspaper contents do affect the perception of the readers regarding ethnic and religious minorities irrespective of the education of the readers, and the language they are printed in (Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart, 2009).

Additionally, the selection of newspaper contents was limited to the past four years only to include and comprehend the current positioning, inclinations, and opinions on ethnic and religious minorities in the selected English papers; *Dawn*, *The Nation* and *Pakistan Today* thus could not be generalized to a larger publication spanning over a longer period of time.

### 6.4 Future Research Implications

The current study highlights several avenues of future research in this area. Longitudinal studies should be conducted in the future to see the shift in trends over the past decade through a critical discourse analysis of the English newspapers corpus to yield more comprehensive results on the misrepresentation and marginalisation of MN. Also, including more than three English newspapers in the sample could reveal different findings over a more diverse range of papers.

A comparison of the representation of MN in the regional languages newspapers to English newspapers of Pakistan could also be a substantial avenue of future research to understand the differences in their

editorial policies and proclivities.

Methodologically, a framework as derived in the present study can be standardised by applying it on other newspaper publications in a different context to detect the under or misrepresentation and check for marginalisation of ethnic and religious minorities.

Finally, future research might seek to explore the impact of these news stories on the readers. A psychological study using the present framework could be conducted to investigate the effects on Pakistani readers of harmful newspapers through a comparison of an experimental and control group who are exposed to different types of media conventions. A longitudinal study might also be useful to show the effects on readers' perception of MN if they are exposed to English newspaper content over a prolonged period.

## References

1. Ali, A. (2017). Discursive Reproduction of Ideology in the National Elite Press of Pakistan. *International Journal of Linguistics and Communication*, 5(2), 53–62. <https://doi.org/10.15640/ijlc.v5n2a5>
2. *Attock AC lands in trouble for calling for equal rights for minorities | Pakistan Today*. (2019). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/12/12/attock-ac-lands-in-trouble-for-calling-for-equal>
3. Bilal, H. A., Rafaqat, U., Hassan, N., Mansoor, H., & Zahra, Q. (2012). Editorials of Pakistani English Print Media: Application of CDA. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 4(3). <https://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v4i3.2444>
4. *Bilawal felicitates Christians*. (2019). <https://nation.com.pk/22-Apr-2019/bilawal-felicitates-christians?show=preview>
5. Billiet, J., Eisinga, R., & Scheepers, P. (1996). Ethnocentrism in the low countries: A comparative perspective. In *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* (Vol. 22, Issue 3, pp. 401–416). Carfax Publishing Company. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.1996.9976547>
6. Billig, M. (2008). The language of critical discourse analysis: The case of nominalization. *Discourse and Society*, 19(6), 783–800. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926508095894>
7. *Blaming minorities - Newspaper - DAWN.COM*. (2018). <https://www.dawn.com/news/1425046>
8. Bonyadi, A. & Samuel, M. (2013). Headlines in newspaper editorials: A contrastive study. *Journals.Sagepub.Com*, 3(2), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244013494863>
9. Boomgaarden, H. G., & Vliegenthart, R. (2009). How news content influences anti-immigration attitudes: Germany, 1993-2005. *European Journal of Political Research*, 48(4), 516–542. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-6765.2009.01831.x>
10. Bulck, J. Van Den. (1995). The Selective Viewer: Defining (Flemish) Viewer Types. *European Journal of Communication*, 10(2), 147–177. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0267323195010002001>
11. Cheng, W. (2015). *Corpus-Based Linguistic Approaches to Critical Discourse Analysis Corpus-Based Linguistic Approaches to*. July. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405198431.wbea10262>
12. Davies, D., Caldas-Coulthard, C. R., & Coulthard, M. (1996). Texts and Practices: Readings in Critical Discourse Analysis. In Coulthard and Caldas-Coulthard (Ed.), *The Modern Language Review*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.2307/3737104>
13. Escoffery, S. D. (2006). *How Real Is Reality TV?: Essays on Representation and Truth - Google Books* (S. D. Escoffery (Ed.)). McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers.

14. Fairclough, Norman and Wodak, R. (2001). Critical discourse analysis as a method in social scientific research. In *Methods Of Critical Discourse Analysis* (pp. 121–138). SAGE Publications Ltd.
15. Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and social change*.
16. Fairclough, Norman. (1996). *Language and power* (Vol. 9780813141). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003085850-10>
17. Fairclough, Norman. (2004). *Analyzing Discourse: Textual Analysis for Social Research* (2nd ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.5354/0716-3991.2013.29147>
18. Fairclough, Norman. (2001). *Language and power*. Longman.
19. Fairclough, Norman. (2003). *Analysing Discourse*.
20. Fairclough, Norman. (2010). Language , ideology and power. *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language, Routledge, London*, 25–83.
21. Fairclough, Norman, Graham, P., Lemke, J., & Wodak, R. (2004). Introduction. *Critical Discourse Studies*, 1(1), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405900410001674489>
22. Farrokhi, F., & Nazemi, S. (2015). The Rhetoric of Newspaper Editorials. *Pdfs.Semanticscholar.Org*, 3(2), 155–161.
23. Fartousi, H., & Dumanig, F. P. (2012). *A Rhetorical Analysis of a Daily Editorial: “Another Turn at Recycling.”*
24. FATA - Official Web Portal. (n.d.). Retrieved April 6, 2020, from <http://fata.gov.pk/>
25. *Forced conversions un-Islamic, says PM on Minority Day | Pakistan Today*. (2019). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/07/29/forced-conversions-un-islamic-says-pm-on-minority-day/>
26. Fowler, R. (1996). *On critical linguistics.–Carmen Rosa Caldas-Coulthard & Malcolm Coulthard (toim.): Texts and practices*.
27. Fowler, Roger. (1991a). *Language in the News: Discourse and Ideology in the Press - Roger Fowler - Google Books*. Routledge.
28. Fowler, Roger. (1991b). *Language in the News: Language and Ideology in the Press*.
29. Gerbner, G., & et al. (1977). *Trends in Network Television Drama and Viewer Conceptions of Social Reality, 1967-1976. Violence Profile No. 8* (p. 12). University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia.
30. Gill, F.; & Azhar, M. A. (2018). Critical Discourse Analysis of PM N. Sharif’s UNOGA Discourse Deciphering Covert Rhetoric—Dialectical Perspective. *Communication and Linguistics Studies*, 4(1), 14. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.cls.20180401.12>
31. *Govt committed to minorities empowerment: PM | Pakistan Today*. (2019). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/12/24/govt-committed-to-minorities-empowerment-pm/>
32. Halliday, M. A. K. (1994). An Introduction to Functional Grammar. In *An Introduction to Functional Grammar* (2nd ed.). Edward Arnold. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203783771>
33. Hassan, A. (2018). Language, Media, and Ideology: Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistani News Bulletin Headlines and Its Impact on Viewers. *SAGE Open*, 8(3). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244018792612>
34. Hernández, Á. A. (2008). Discursive strategies in the construction of national identity: A critical discourse analysis of the Gibraltar issue in the printed media. *National Identities*, 10(2), 225–235. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14608940801999156>
35. Hirsch, P. M. (1980). The “Scary World” of the nonviewer and other anomalies: A Reanalysis of

- Gerbner et al.'s Findings on Cultivation Analysis: Part I. *Communication Research*, 7(4), 403–456. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009365028000700401>
36. *Islamophobic posters showing Muslims as anti-Hindu people surface in Lahore | Pakistan Today*. (2020). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2020/02/07/islamophobic-posters-showing-muslims-as-anti-hindu-people-surface-in-lahore/>
37. *Kashmir crisis and the role of minorities*. (2019). <https://nation.com.pk/01-Sep-2019/kashmir-crisis-and-the-role-of-minorities>
38. Khan, F., Aslam, M., & Aadil, M. (2018). Discourse and Rhetoric: A Study of Pakistani English Newspaper Editorials. *NUML Journal of Critical Inquiry*, 16(1), 66–82.
39. Koopmans, R., & Olzak, S. (2004). Discursive opportunities and the evolution of right-wing violence in Germany. *American Journal of Sociology*, 110(1), 198–230. <https://doi.org/10.1086/386271>
40. Kress, G., & Hodge, R. (1993). Transformations and Truth. In *Language as ideology* (pp. 1–37).
41. Kroonenberg, P. M., & Veer, R. (1980). Race discrimination in the preparation of newspaper reports: a reanalysis of a research by Frank Bovenkerk | People and society. *People and Society*, 55(3).
42. *LAW: THE RIGHT TO KNOW - Newspaper - DAWN.COM*. (2019). <https://www.dawn.com/news/1510551>
43. Levine, R. A., & Campbell, D. T. (1972). *Ethnocentrism : theories of conflict, ethnic attitudes, and group behavior*. Wiley.
44. Liu, S. (2004). An examination of the Social categorization of Chinese ethnic groups and its influence on intergroup relations in Australia. *54th Annual Conference of the ICA, September*.
45. Lubbers, M., Scheepers, P., & Vergeer, M. (2010). Exposure to newspapers and attitudes toward ethnic minorities: A longitudinal analysis. *Howard Journal of Communications*, 11(2), 127–143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/106461700246661>
46. Mahmood, R., Obaid, M., & Shakir, A. (2014). A Critical Discourse Analysis of Figurative Language in Pakistani English Newspapers. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 6(3), 210. <https://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v6i3.5412>
47. *Mainstreaming minorities*. (2015). Retrieved June 6, 2020, from <https://nation.com.pk/31-Oct-2015/mainstreaming-minorities>
48. Mezzera, M., & Sial, S. (2010). *IFP Democratisation and Transitional Justice Cluster Country case study: Pakistan Media and Governance in Pakistan: A controversial yet essential relationship*.
49. Mills, S. (2004). *Discourse*. Routledge.
50. *Minorities at risk - Newspaper - DAWN.COM*. (2018). <https://www.dawn.com/news/1452941>
51. *Minorities face daunting challenge in elections | Pakistan Today*. (2018). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/07/23/minorities-face-daunting-challenge-in-elections/>
52. *Minorities in the Islamic Republic*. (n.d.). <https://nation.com.pk/27-Mar-2014/minorities-in-the-islamic-republic>
53. *Minorities still unable to get equality in South Asia*. (2019). <https://nation.com.pk/11-Jul-2019/minorities-still-unable-to-get-equality-in-south-asia>
54. *NAWAIWAQT GROUP*. (n.d.).
55. Nemickienė, Ž. (1977). *LINGUISTIC MEANS FOR REALIZATION AND EVALUATION OF THE MESSAGE IN NEWSPAPER PROFESIN Ė S STUDIJOS* :
56. Oliver, M. B. (1999). Caucasian viewers' memory of black and white criminal suspects in the news.

- Journal of Communication*, 49(3), 46–60. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1999.tb02804.x>
57. Orpin, D. (2005). Corpus Linguistics and Critical Discourse Analysis: Examining the ideology of sleaze. *International Journal of Corpus Linguistics*, 10(1), 37–61. <https://doi.org/10.1075/ijcl.10.1.03orp>
58. *Pakistan – A haven for minorities | Pakistan Today*. (2016). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2016/07/03/pakistan-a-haven-for-minorities/>
59. *Petition filed in IHC against violation of minorities job quota | Pakistan Today*. (2019). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/11/15/petition-filed-in-ihc-against-violation-of-minorities-job-quota/>
60. Pieterse, H. J. C., Scheepers, P. L. H., & Van der Ven, J. A. (1993). Plural religious beliefs: A Comparison between the Dutch and white South Africans. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 49(1/2). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v49i1/2.2487>
61. Potter, W. J. (1993). Cultivation Theory and Research: A Conceptual Critique. *Human Communication Research*, 19(4), 564–601. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2958.1993.tb00313.x>
62. Qazi, H. & Shah, S. (2018). Identity Constructions Through Media Discourses: Malala Yousafzai in Pakistani English newspapers. *Journalism Studies*, 19(11), 1597–1612. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1284574>
63. *Religious inclusion - Newspaper - DAWN.COM*. (2019). <https://www.dawn.com/news/1517334>
64. Richardson, John, E. (2007). *Analysing newspapers. An approach from Critical Discourse Analysis*.
65. Richardson, J. E. (2007). Social Practices: Journalism and the Material World. In *Analysing Newspapers* (pp. 114–148). [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-230-20968-8\\_5](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-0-230-20968-8_5)
66. Saeed, S. & Rahman, B. H. (2019). *Role of Media in Constructing Pakistani National Identity with reference to War on Terror , USA and Afghanistan*. 1(56), 271–280.
67. Sahill, P. H. (2018). The terror speaks: Inside Pakistan’s terrorism discourse and national action plan. *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*, 41(4), 319–337. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1057610X.2017.1284448>
68. Sajjad, F. (2013). Critical Discourse Analysis of News Headline about Imran Khna’s Peace March towards Wazaristan. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 7(3), 18–24. <https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-0731824>
69. Scheepers, P., Schmeets, H., & Felling, A. (1997). Fortress Holland? Support for ethnocentric policies among the 1994-electorate of The Netherlands. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 20(1), 145–159. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.1997.9993951>
70. Seidlhofer, B. (2004). Research Perspectives on Teaching English as a Lingua Franca. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 24. <https://doi.org/10.1017/s0267190504000145>
71. Seyal, Waqar & Hassan, T. (2017). *Representation of Indigenous People in Pakistan*. 22(2).
72. Shafer, J. G. (2017). Donald trump’s “political incorrectness”: Neoliberalism as frontstage racism on social media. *Social Media and Society*, 3(3), 205630511773322. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2056305117733226>
73. Shah, H. (2010). The Tongue-tied Press of Pakistan: Comparing English and Urdu Newspapers. *South Asia Monitor*, 148.
74. Skerrett, A. (2014). Religious Literacies in a Secular Literacy Classroom. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 49(2), 233–250. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.65>
75. Smootha, S. (1987). Jewish and Arab ethnocentrism in Israel. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 10(1), 1–26. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.1987.9993553>

76. Stilling, E. A. (1997). The electronic melting pot hypothesis: The cultivation of acculturation among hispanics through television viewing. *Howard Journal of Communications*, 8(1), 77–100. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10646179709361744>
77. Stubbs, M. (1997). Whorf's children: Critical comments on critical discourse analysis (CDA). *British Studies in Applied Linguistics*, 12, 100–116.
78. Tajfel, H. (1982). *Social Identity and Intergroup Relations*. Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2069233>
79. *The Aasia bibi lesson | Pakistan Today*. (2018). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/11/01/the-aasia-bibi-lesson/>
80. *The state of the minorities | Pakistan Today*. (2020). <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2020/03/01/the-state-of-the-minorities/>
81. Van Dijk, T. (1993). Elite Discourse and Racism. In *Elite Discourse and Racism*. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781483326184>
82. Van Dijk, T. A. (1987). Communicating racism : ethnic prejudice in thought and talk. In *Sage*.
83. Van Dijk, T. A. (1991). Racism and the press. In *Routledge*.
84. Van Dijk, T. A. (1998). Chapter 18 Critical Discourse Analysis. In *Handbook of discourse analysis*.
85. Van Dijk, T. A. (2008). Critical discourse analysis and nominalization: problem or pseudo-problem? *Discourse & Society*, 19(6), 821–828. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926508095897>
86. Van Dijk, T. A. (2015). Racism and the press. In *Racism and the Press*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315682662>
87. VanDijk, T. (1998). *Ideology : a multidisciplinary approach / Teun A. van Dijk*. Sage Publications Ltd.
88. Vergeer, M., Rutten, P., & Scheepers, P. (1996). *Cultivation Theory in a Changed Media Landscape : Overview of Previous Studies and a Review for a Medium City*.
89. Widdowson, H. G. (1996). Reply to Fairclough: Discourse and interpretation: Conjectures and refutations. In *Language and Literature* (Vol. 5, Issue 1, pp. 57–69). Addison Wesley Longman Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1177/096394709600500106>
90. Widdowson, H. G. (2007). *Discourse Analysis*. Oxford University Press.
91. Wodak, R., & Meyer, M. (2001). Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis. In *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. SAGE Publications, Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9780857028020>